ETCETH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CIVIL/CRIMINAL DIfyW0114113HT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

THE STATE OF NEVADA,

Plaintiff,

VS.

KIRSTIN BLAISE LOBATO,

Defendant.

CASE NO. C177394

DEPT. NO. II

Transcripts of Proceedings

BEFORE THE HONORABLE VALORIE J. VEGA, DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

"ROUGH DRAFT"

JURY TRIAL - DAY 4□ VOLUME IV

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006

COURT RECORDER:

TRANSCRIPTION BY:

LISA LIZOTTE

NW TRANSCRIPTS, LLC. District Court 1027 S. RAINBOW BLVD., #148

LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89145-6232

(702) 373-7457

nwtranscripts@msn.com

Proceedings recorded by electronic sound recording, transcript produced by transcription service.

9/14/06

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE STATE:

BILL KEPHART

Chief Deputy District Attorney 200 South Third Street Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 (702) 455-3482

SANDRA K. DIGIACOMO Deputy District Attorney 200 South Third Street Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 (702) 455-6450

FOR THE DEFENDANT:

DAVID M. SCHIECK

Special Public Defender 333 South Third Street, 2' Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89155 (702) 455-6265

SHARI L. GREENBERGER, ESQ. SARA ZALKIN, ESQ.

506 Broadway

San Francisco, California 94133

INDEX OF EXHIBITS

ADMITTED

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006

STATE'S EXHIBITS:

STATES EXHIBITS.	
1 Photograph of Nevada State Bank 2 Photograph of patrol vehicle and detectives 3 Photograph of crime scene 4 Photograph of crime scene 5 Photograph of crime scene 6 Photograph of foot and garbage 7 thru 37 - Photographs of crime scene Photograph of Duran Bailey 116 Photograph of dumpster area 117 Photograph of dumpster area 118 Photograph of dumpster area 119 Photograph of dumpster and Palms 120 Photograph of dumpster area, Gold Coast	81 117 117 65 117 65 117 93 93 93 93
and Rio 121 Aerial photograph of crime scene area	93
and surrounding properties 137 Photograph of dumpster area 139 Photograph of dumpster and planter 142 Photograph of camera 143 Photograph of camera 144 Photograph of foot prints in blood	80 100 100 121 121 121

INDEX <u>OF V</u>	<u>VITNESSES</u>
-------------------	------------------

DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006

STATE'S WITNESSES:

Richard Shot 54 61 78 105 152 Lueron Williams 66 71 77 97 149 93 lain Anderson 79 James Testa 108 125

INDEX OF EXHIBITS

ADMIt T ED

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006

DEFENDANT'S EXHIBITS:

Photograph of crime scene Photograph of crime scene Photograph of crime scene 145 145 Α В

VV V LOBATO 9/14/06

S VEGAS, NEVADA

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006

PROCEEDINGS

(THE PROCEEDINGS BEGAN AT 01:19:26)

(Jurors are present)

THE BAILIFF: All rise.

Department II is now in session, the Honorable Valorie J, Vega presiding, Please be seated.

THE COURT: Good afternoon, everyone. The record shall reflect we're resuming trial in State versus Kirstin Lobato under Case Number C177394, in the presence of the defendant, together with her three counsel, the two prosecuting attorneys, and the ladies and gentlemen of the jury who were seated yesterday.

Proceeding forward now with the opening statements. The prosecution may proceed.

MR. KEPHART: Thank you, Your Honor,

STATE'S OPENING STATEMENT

MR. KEPHART: If it pleases the Court, counsel for the defense, Ms. DiGiacomo

Ladies and gentlemem thank you for your patience in this last three days, we're here four days now and finally you get to hear what the State intends to prove in this matter, You heard that the State has charged the defendant with murder in the first degree. It's called open murder. And she's

IV-6

on Arville and he waited for a couple hours and then he called the police, The police met him there, and he directed them to this area where officers responded to the area, went in. And you see the dumpster that is here, One of the officers moved that dumpster back out of the way so you could gain entrance in it. He will testify that it was on an angle when he first went in and he had to move it so he could get back in there,

The -- what he found was a pile of garbage back in the back of that dumpster. And when they removed portions of that, they found a man by the name of Duran Bailey. It's a forty-four-year-old black male. But you're gonna hear, he's gonna be introduced to you by his cousin and how he was a homeless man, how he lived basically on the streets. But the reason why he was at this area, at the Nevada State Bank, is he actually had an account and he did some banking because he was disabled and received SSI payments, and he had a bank account to keep his account in,

Now you're gonna hear a lot of testimony from some crime scene analyst that went out there and recovered this garbage. And if you look back here at this picture, you can see he's basically completely buried, And without moving items of the garbage, they couldn't see him other than his foot.

You're gonna hear from a coroner that's gonna tell

IV-8

also charged with sexual penetration of a dead human body.

You heard somewhat of the time frame of when this occurred. This occurred back in July 8th of 2001. It happened here on West Flamingo. You take a look over here. This is the Palms Hotel as it currently is now This photo was taken back then, Down here is the Gold Coast. This is Flamingo running from your left to right, and Wynn Road here, This is the Nevada State Bank parking lot. You're gonna hear some testimony about how the Palms employees were using that as well. There's a besert area here. It's not desert any longer. It's been developed Right here where it says "Crime Scene" is a trash dumpster. It's behind the --- behind the Nevada State Bank there.

Okay. Around 10:36, 10:30 pm., on the 8, it's a Sunday, 2001, a man by the name of Mr. Shott was in the area and dumpster diving. Now you're gonna hear some testimony from previous hearing that he gave. And he went to this area right here and the — it was unsecured, meaning that the gates weren't locked He was able to go into the area. And when he walked in, he saw this. Right here is the foot of a man. He saw that. He backed out And he told us in a previous hearing that he was afraid that somebody might think it was him that he did this, He knew — he recognized it as a person's foot And he walked up to a gas station that's located up here

you that Duran suffered multiple injuries. He suffered blunt force trauma to his head, multiple stab and incised wounds, multiple stab wounds, multiple cut wounds, multiple defensive wounds, head wounds, and he also suffered some postmortem wounds. And what I mean by that is that after he died, additional things were done to him in the — meaning that they severed his penis and his anus was stabbed, The doctor will tell you that was sexually motivated.

Now Duran Bailey, when they tested his body, they found that he obviously uses alcohol 'cause he had a .11 blood alcohol concentrate in his blood. They also found that he uses drugs because he had a cocaine metabolite in his -- in his blood. And you'll also hear that in the past he had actually provided drugs to individuals and he actually traded sex for drugs.

Now once they, the police, got involved and homicide arrived and they did what they could with the — with the crime scene, you'll hear that they fingerprinted practically everything they could fingerprint. They collected multiple pieces of evidence or pieces of garbage to see whether or not they could get some evidence off of it. The police really didn't have much to go on. They really didn't. They didn't have a suspect. They didn't have a -- they didn't catch anybody at the scene. They didn't really know much what to do until the

<u>VV. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

20th of July of 2001. They received a phone call from a lady up in Pioche, Nevada, And keep this in mind, just keep this quote in mind, "I didn't think anybody would miss somebody like that." Keep that in mind, and I'll come back to you and I'll tell you why that's important. Well, they get a phone call from this lady up in Pioche and she tells the -- she calls and asks if there's anything in Las Vegas that involves a man getting his penis cut off. And as unique as that is, homicide quickly traveled to Pioche, contacted her, and that let her -- led them to the defendant.

Basically, what the police ended up finding out is there's a lady by the name of Dixie Tienken that -- and you'll get an opportunity to view her and see her and listen to her, And keep in mind that she will tell you that she was basically the defendant's confidante in that town, She was his -- she, the defendant, was one of her kids, She's a teacher from up there and part of the reason this defendant had felt that Dixie was somebody that she could go to and confide in and give her -- tell her abotit things that bothered her, Well, she ended up telling the police that what she believed was either the 11th or the 18th of July of 2001, the defendant came to her house early in the morning, extremely upset about something that she had done in Las Vegas, Well, they sat down and ended up speaking for about three hours. The defendant was looking

1V-10

through newspapers, trying to find out whether or not there was anything that had been reported in Las Vegas about a man, which she describes to Dixie as an old, smelly, black man, had lost his penis, had his penis cut off, Actually, Dixie will tell you they actually even looked in the Internet to see whether or not they could find anything on the Internet.

And Dixie went on to explain to the police that she felt, based on the defendant's demeanor, is that this just had happened, had to happen, she will say, she believed within a week of when this occurred. She said that the defendant was extremely concerned about whether or not this man — whether or not they found, the authorities, found out anything about this particular man. And she tells Dixie that what had happened is that she had been propositioned by this man, eventually attacked by this man, and she, the defendant, took out her butterfly knife, which you're gonna hear that she has had and many of her friends knew about that she'd used, Her father actually gave it to her. She was proficient with being able to open it with one hand, if any of you ever know what a butterfly knife is, and that she whipped that out of her skirt she was wearing, she reached down, grabbed the man's penis and cut it off.

Now she tells multiple friends up in Panaca the same thing on various dates, that she cut a man's penis, she

stabbed a man's penis, she cut a man's penis off,

Dixie says that before she did this, the defendant says that before she cut this man's penis off is the man tried to put it in her mouth. She said she pulled the knife out and cut his penis. She described, the interesting part is, she described to the police where the defendant told her it had happened. Dixie will tell you that she used to live on the west side of I-1S and that when she was talking to the defendant, the defendant told her it was either on the west side of Tropicana or the west side of Flamingo. She said not Sahara, she remembers that, but she remembers those two hotel names. And this happens to be on West Flamingo.

She tells Dixie that when she cuts the man's penis off, Dixie's words that she said, "She got ick on her," meaning that she got blood on her. 'Cause she tells, eventually, the police -- the police do talk to the defendant as well. And what they do is they go to her house and she's just getting out of the shower, and it's two homicide detectives and they'll explain to you in detail what they did. When they got to her house, she comes out of that — out of the bathroom after taking a shower and she is -- they have with her -- their badges, they have with them their shirt and they have a satchel that says "Homicide" on it. They tell her that they're from homicide and they tell her why they're there. She puts her head down and

1V-12

she starts to cry, and she tells the police, "I didn't think anyone would miss him," Before they say anything about — anything about the crime, "I didn't think anybody would miss him," Then within twelve minutes of her getting her Miranda rights and signing a card and saying "I'll talk to them," they start a taped statement, and you're gonna have an opportunity to hear that full taped statement. And in that taped statement she says, "I didn't think anybody would miss anybody like that." And she describes the person like that as, "An older, smelly, black man, a person who smelled like alcohol and dirty diapers,"

After they show her a picture of the man, she says she was trying to put him out of her mind. While they're at the house, the defendant's mom comes home. And the defendant looks at the mom and says, "Mom, I did it, Now I have to do what I have to do," Her father comes home. And she says, "I'm sorry, Daddy, but I told you I did something awful," Now bear in mind she has spoken to her parents. "I told you, Daddy. I'm sorry, Daddy, I told you I did something wrong." Bear in mind and think about that when you hear other witnesses testifying about the small town of Panaca and about things that maybe her mother had influences over people, things that they may have -- that she may have been saying to people.

> 2 3

On the way back to Las Vegas after the defendant was arrested, she tells the police officers that her father had provided her that knife for Christmas. They get to Las Vegas and she's being booked into the Clark County Detention Center, and she is standing inside of one of the holding cells. And you'll get an opportunity to see the very holding cell. As a matter of fact, she was in a holding cell when she tells the police officers, "This looks just like the place or similar to the place that this happened," And she describes, she describes it as the only difference is that she could see out, as she's looking up, and she says, "I could see the parking structure from inside," The top of this structure you'll see is covered with chainlink fencing and up to the left hand side in this photograph is the parking structure next to it. Notice the bottom of the parking structure, there's a curb that goes all the way around it, and you'll notice the inside of the cell when you get an opportunity to see that.

Now the officers, when they're talking to her, and she explained to them that she got blood on herself and she got in the car. She told Dixie, after she got ick on herself, all she wanted to do was get washed up and get back to Panaca to her father's. She tells the police that she got blood all over her and she threw away her clothes, she threw away the knife, and she had driven by herself in a red Fiero, her little car. She

IV-14

gonna hear from the medical examiner that will give you basically a ballpark time figure of when that body was probably killed, when Duran was probably killed, She says, she tells the police on the taped statement, that it happened on the 20 of July, that it happened a couple of weeks ago in Las Vegas. They ask her if there's a dumpster located near where it occurred. And she said, "There is one near but I didn't put him in it. I don't think I could have." But you're gonna have an opportunity to see the actual scene, More so than what I just showed you here, and show you that the body had been moved from the back corner over there towards where the dumpster was.

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Now she tells the police that she was on a three-day binge of methamphetamine and she believed that this happened on the third day. You're gonna hear from her friends that tell you that whenever they were together she would bring methamphetamine to the table. You're gonna hear that one of her boyfriends broke up with her because of her methamphetamine use and issues. And they'd also tell you that she would do anything she could do to get her hands on methamphetamine and her attitude changed quite a bit when she was on methamphetamine.

Interestingly, in her statement, she tells the police, "I didn't tell anybody about this," But you're gonna see that

IV-16

told Dixie that she was concerned that somebody would have seen her red Fiero. She wasn't concerned about her being seen because she was in an enclosed area, but she was worried about her being seen in her red Fiero and that she'd be caught because of that But she drove her red Fiero back to Panaca.

Now Laura will tell you Dixie told her that the defendant told Dixie that she went back to Panaca because she needed to hide her car, needed to hide out, and there's a possibility her parents would even help her get it painted.

When the police are talking to her about her car and talking to her about the crime, they ask her is there anything else that you hit him with other than your knife. And her response to that was, "It's possible, I have a bat in the car. I had a bat in the car." And you're gonna get an opportunity to see that bat. You're gonna hear testimony from the medical examiner about the extent of the injuries that Mr. Bailey received and to the degree of the injury that would be consistent with the use of that bat.

The police talked to her about, and like I said you're getting the opportunity to hear that and see those words, the police talked to her about this and she says that it happened late at night or early in the morning. And she corrects herself and says, "No, it happened early in the morning," And you're

that's not correct. Many of her friends, many people from up in Panaca, were told by her words, Dixie one of them. She tells the police that when she got blood on her that it was smeared on her shoulder and on her clothing, mostly in the mid-section of her body. Her stories that she tells the police, her friends, Dixie, all seem to be consistent about her cutting a man's penis off.

You're also gonna hear about how she met a new boyfriend and that she moved out of one of her friend's house the end of June, the beginning of July, and that shortly after she moved in with her new boyfriend, who you'll hear that she and he did methamphetamine quite often together, that they would do these binging-type episodes, is that she wanted to go to Panaca for the 4" of July celebration. Now bear in mind we're telling you that this occurred on the 8" of July, and that you're gonna hear from some individuals in Panaca that talk about how her and her mother were fighting on the 5' and 6' in Panaca and that the fight was about her leaving and coming back to Las Vegas, Keep in mind she's got a new boyfriend, she's doing methamphetamine, she's up in Panaca with her and she's fighting with her mom.

Well, we know that she traveled frequently between Las Vegas and Panaca and she drove her car. But on the 9" of July, after this occurred, her new boyfriend drove to Panaca

<u>V v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

in his car and picked her up and took her back to Las Vegas, leaving her car there, only to have her father then come down and pick her up later on just on that week.

Dates are important here. You heard the defense has indicated that they potentially are addressing and presenting a defense of alibi, so dates are important. I told you that the defendant's mother, there's some interest with the defendant's mother talking to people about dates. Keep that in mind,

Dixie will tell you that her family covers for each other, Michele Austria, a friend of the defendant's that will tell you about her conversation with the defendant, will tell you that when she spoke to the defendant, the defendant had indicated to her that she was now taking medication for depression and that she had just gotten on it by the doctor.

When the police found her, they also took her car and they impounded her car, brought it down here to Las Vegas, And when they first came into contact with the defendant, that's who they were talking to, And when she explained about the use of her car, and they knew information about her putting her car there or hiding her car, the crime scene analysts, they took her -- took her car and brought it back here to a lab in Las Vegas to process it. Interestingly, you'll hear from the crime scene analysts that will tell you that

1V-18

than the luminol or vice versa. You'll get an opportunity to hear the chemists on that. And the chemist won't come in here and tell you that it's 100 percent blood, but he will tell you —

MR. SCHIECK: Objection, Your Honor, that's not so,
MR. KEPHART: He will not come in here and say
that it's -- he's 100 percent positive that there's blood.
MR. SCHIECK: I thought you said it is 100 percent
positive.

MR, !KEPHART: No, I did not say that, MR. SCHIECK: Then I withdraw the objection, THE COURT: Very well,

MR. KEPHART: And but he will tell you the effects that cleaning can do to affect blood and even destroy a blood sample. He'll tell you there was certain tests that you have to do to confirm that it's blood and he wasn't able to get what they call hemoglobin out of the blood in that -- out of that test. But you'll get an opportunity to see what they saw.

Now you — we told you it's gonna take approximately three weeks, maybe less, The State's case in chief won't be that long to present. It'll be probably about four or five days. Bear in mind, keep — you have notes there, keep your notes with regards to what you hear with the witnesses. You're going to -- I'd be real surprised if you didn't

1V-20

she had car seats on her car, slip covers on her seats in her car, so it was a — it's a small Fiero, 2-seater, and that she says she doesn't believe that the seat covers are new because the nature of what she believed -- I mean, seen with them but she believes that they were freshly laundered. And that's gonna play a part in whether or not they can locate or identify substances like blood in that car.

Well, they also did -- they fingerprinted her car and, interestingly enough, her car had none of her fingerprints in it. They did certain tests of the car. They -- there's two presumptive tests that they performed. One is what they call a luminol test, And you're gonna get an opportunity to actually see what that luminol showed. The door panel of that car, the driver's seat door panel, the driver's door panel shows what appears to be some type of smudge with leaving a hand print on that door. And bear in mind, she told the police that she had gotten in her car bloody, and she told Dixie she had gotten in her car bloody.

The seat cover showed a small, minute trace of what could be consistent with blood. Then when they took the seat cover off, they sprayed it on the seat itself, and you'll get an opportunity to see that as well, That's a presumptive test. Then they did another presumptive test called phenolphthalein, and phenolphthalein is a little more sensitive

hear certain things that were conflicting. But you're going to hear a lot of information at little pieces from more -- from different people, and you need to keep good notes with that so that you can remind yourself as to what you heard from these witnesses.

Now the Court tells you that what we say as attorneys is not evidence, Well, I'm not telling you anything other than what you're gonna hear from the evidence, what you're gonna hear from the stand, what people are gonna tell you, what they saw, what they heard when they testify to you. And keep in mind, when you listen and sit here, keep in mind and ask yourself certain questions. Ask yourself is this a mere coincidence that the defendant would be interested in somebody in Las Vegas that's dirty, smelly, old, alcohol-stinky, black man or diaper -- stinky-diaper, black man without a penis. Is it a coincidence that she appears to be depressed shortly after this man is dead, and is it a coincidence that she tells Dixie that she was concerned about her vehicle being seen to the point where she wanted to leave it in Panaca, hide it, clean it up, possibly get it painted, and is it mere coincidence that she just happened to have a bat in her car?

Ladies and gentlemen, when you get an opportunity to sit here and listen to this full trial, at the end of the trial Ms. DiGiacomo and I are gonna be asking you to find her guilty of

\IV <u>v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

/4

these charges. You need to make the decision whether or not you believe she did this and you need to base it on what you hear from these witnesses.

Thank you,

is

THE COURT: Defendant's opening,

 $MS.\ GREENBERGER:\ Thank\ you,\ Your\ Honor.$

DEFENDANT'S OPENING STATEMENT

MS. GREENBERGER: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen of the jury, Your Honor, defense counsel, counsel, ladies and gentlemen, audience.

As you know from yesterday, my name is Shari Greenberger and I'm one of the attorneys representing Kirstin Biaise Lobato. And I ask you, please keep an open mind until you hear all of the evidence.

As the prosecution stated, this opening statement is not evidence. And I ask you to keep an open mind until you go back to the jury deliberation room. I ask you to not take my word for what I'm saying here in opening statement but to please carefully scrutinize the evidence, analyze the forensic evidence that comes in in this case, pay attention to the science. It is our position that the evidence in this case speaks volumes

I've prepared a presentation of what the evidence case — in this case will show, and there is a lot of information

IV-22

so I'm gonna try to go through it quickly just to give you an overview of what we believe the evidence in this case will show. And, as indicated by the prosecution, the evidence is based on the testimony of witnesses and the evidence that was collected at the scene. This is just a framework for you to see the direction this case is going, so I've tried to summarize it

My client's name, Kirstin Blaise Lobato. She was named Blaise as a nickname that for -- after a movie actress, was her testimony, and is known as Blaise in the community of Panaca where she lives. The evidence will show that when she was eighteen years old she was wrongly charged with murder As she sit here today, she is twenty-three years old.

There is no dispute in this case that a terrible crime was committed. And I apologize that in this case there is going to be a lot of gruesome photographs from the crime scene There is no dispute that Duran Bailey, a homeless man, with crack cocaine in his system and alcohol, was killed, There is also no dispute that Duran Bailey's cause of death was a stab to his carotid artery. There is no dispute that he was dismembered postmortem, after death. There's no dispute on those facts. What there is a dispute about in this case is whether my client, Kirstin Blaise Lobato, committed this crime, And I say to you she never met the victim in this case, Duran

Bailey, and we will demonstrate that through the evidence. The reason we know this is because we have witnesses, a number of witnesses, that will testify she was not in Las Vegas when this crime was committed.

She was raised in the town of Panaca. We've had some discussion in voir dire about Panaca. It's a small town, I think some of you described it as a one-horse town. I've been there myself. One gas station, one convenience store, a very small town, I think maybe 800 people, and it's 160 miles from Las Vegas,

More importantly, or equally significant, in this case is that there is no physical evidence, none, that ties her to this crime. And let me inform you, this was a crime scene that was rich, rich, with physical evidence. All of the physical evidence, and I'm going to get into that further in my presentation, but I'm talking DNA, I'm talking bloody shoe prints, tire tracks, fingerprint analysis, analysis on my client's vehicle, no evidence connecting her. And, ladies and gentlemen, the reason this is so important is because the physical evidence in this case excludes my client. And I want you to listen very carefully because there is gonna be a lot of testimony from homicide detectives, crime scene analysts, forensic scientists, and these people combed through the crime scene and they analyzed it at the lab, and the tests have conclusively come

IV-24

back showing the physical evidence does not match my client. That's why when I began, I said to you the physical evidence speaks for itself. Please don't just rely on my words but look at the physical evidence. You are the trier of fact. You will make that decision in the jury deliberation room, And consider, because in the prosecution's opening he advised that there's gonna be a number of witnesses that come in, and when you're analyzing the evidence there's a lot of hesaid/she-said, she said that, consider that when you're analyzing the physical evidence. And you will weigh this evidence. You will make the final decision.

I'm gonna start with the time line of relevant events. Around Memorial Day, 2001, which is a number of years ago, my client, Kirstin Blaise Lobato, had been living in Las Vegas. She was alone. It was a dark night. She had been staying at a hotel in town, some of you might know it, the Budget Suites. It's on Boulder Highway and East Flamingo, As she got out of her vehicle in a dark parking lot, out of nowhere a man from behind pushed her on the ground. She did not get a good glimpse of her assailant. What she saw, he was big, he smelled, he was over 6 feet, over 200 pounds, and he was exposed. This man was attempting to rape my client. She was on the ground. She had a short skirt on He pushed up her skirt. Knowing that she was gonna get raped if she didn't

<u>4V v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

do something and not prepared to be victimized, she was able to remove a knife that she had in her back pocket that she carried for protection. Ladies and gentlemen, she took that knife, she stabbed him and she fled the scene, When she looked back, she saw the man holding himself and standing. This attack occurred on the east side of town, East Flamingo, and it's very important because Duran Bailey, the homeless man in this case that was found in the dumpster, he was found —

MR. KEPHART: Judge, I'm gonna object. He was not found in a dumpster.

MS. GREENBERGER: He was found --THE COURT: Sustained,

MS. GREENBERGER: -- next to a dumpster, excuse me.

Thank you

He was found on the west side of Vegas, across from what is now the Palms Hotel, wasn't built yet. Separate parts of town. No 'dispute that at the time my client was attacked she was using drugs. She had been using methamphetamine for several days, and you will hear testimony about that. She was using methamphetamine, Duran Bailey was found with cocaine in his system, another important distinction,

IV-26

She was able to flee from the scene and escape her attacker. She was not raped. And she returned to the town of Panaca, where she was -- grown up, July 2', 2001, The reason why these dates are important, and you'll hear testimony filling in the time in between, is that she returned to Panaca July 2nd, 2001 and remained in Panaca until July 9th, 2001. And there's not just one or two witnesses. There's gonna be a number of witnesses that come here to testify about seeing her in Panaca during that time period. Duran Bailey was killed July 8th, 2001.

Now, as I mentioned, there's a complicated set of facts in this case, so I want to explain to you a little bit about what's going on on the west side of town in Vegas. There's a woman. Her name is Diane Parker, You will hear her testimony, Diane Parker was raped by a man, Duran Bailey, the victim in this case, exactly, exactly one week before he was found next to the dumpster. Why is that important? Well, Diane Parker knew Duran Bailey. And I'll get into the details of that rape in a minute. But he was found one week after she was raped, one block from where she lived, because the dumpster where he stayed at night, he was homeless, at the Nevada State Bank was one block from Diane Parker's residence. The prosecution says, ladies and gentlemen, let's talk about coincidence, I ask you the same You are the triers

of fact. Please, please, consider this. And when he was found, another key point, there was plastic wrap around his body, plastic wrap with blood on it. You will see pictures when he was in the autopsy room. This plastic wrap would have been rich with physical evidence. You will hear testimony about it. It was not tested,

Want to talk about another coincidence? Diane Parker, rape victim of Duran Bailey, she was at the crime scene where Duran Bailey was found. Ladies and gentlemen, she identified his body. So when we talk about coincidence, please, please consider that, one block away. This is Diane Parker, attacked July 1't, 2001.

Let me tell you a little bit about Diane Parker, She was a former sexual partner of Duran Bailey, She was outside her apartment on July 1, having a beer with some friends, acquaintances, at her apartment complex, the same apartment complex that's one block from the crime scene. Duran Bailey came up to her. He wanted to talk with her, And she was having a beer with her friends. We only know them, and forgive me, it may not be politically correct but she testifies to they're -- describes them as Mexicans, She's having a beer with her friends. Duran Bailey comes up to talk to her She says something to the effect of, no, not now, I'm hanging out with these people, What does he do? He smacks her across

IV-28

the face in front of her friends, and some of them or one of them gets into a confrontation, verbal, and tells him bug off. He leaves.

She goes to do the laundry, It's July 1st still. It's nighttime, She's washing her laundry, carrying it back to her room, looks over her shoulder as she's putting the key in the door, Duran Bailey is there. She doesn't want anything to do with him. Ladies and gentlemen, at that time he pushes his way into the apartment and punches her, to-wit: the black eye, and begins what you will hear evidence is of a series of rapes and badly, badly beats her. Now this is one week prior to his death, He rapes her on the bed, Then he drags her into the bathroom and he tries to sodomize her multiple times And just so you know all the evidence, my client, Kirstin Blaise Lobato, never met Diane Parker ever, separate victim, separate incident. And, again, my client has never met Duran Bailey but Diane Parker has, Another coincidence in this case, When he rapes her, he rapes her at knife point at her carotid artery. You want to talk about coincidence. His cause of death, severing carotid artery. Keep note of that, another important point.

She contacts the police. And let me say, she's very, very afraid of this man. She told the police, "Yes, he told me he was going to kill me." The police say where did he hold the

IV-29

N <u>v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

knife. She tells them, "He held it at my neck," He gave her two black eyes, he kicked her in the shoulder, he had the knife on the side of her vein. And you will hear this testimony. He had her down and he had, this is what she told the police and will testify to, "He had me down. He had the knife to my neck, like I said, right by the vein and he said, 'Now I've got to kill you,- He held it to her throat and threatened her. And she called the police because she was scared because after he did this horrible rape, beating, attempted sodomy to her, he came back and was knocking on her window and she was afraid, rightfully

Interestingly, when he was found dead at the crime scene, he had on the same clothes he wore, you'll hear evidence of this, when he raped her. That's an important fact to keep note of.

When the police interviewed Diane, she told them the full story, as I'm telling you now, including that when she was earlier in the day having a beer, there were some people that witnessed him slap her She thought, you know, that was important, there were witnesses that could corroborate this. You're gonna hear testimony that the police did not do any followup investigation on these Mexicans, despite the fact she showed them where these people lived, no investigation done except for running their rap sheets through the system. She

1V-30

home, but I can show you where he lives." Did the police follow up on the investigation? She said she could take them to him. "I can show you this is the man that raped me," Ladies and gentlemen, they said we'll get to that later. They wanted to take her to the hospital, get her some treatment. And keep in mind, these pictures are taken days after the rape, so you can only imagine what they looked like at the time. The police said we'll get to that later. Well, you know what, the police never got to it until they were at the crime scene when he was lying there dead on July 8th, had been brutally beaten from head to toe, And, again, you'll see these photos, And after the stab to the carotid artery that killed him and the various other beatings, he was dismembered after death, postmortem. When my client freed herself from her attacker in May, 2001, the man was standing, holding himself, Duran Bailey was dismembered after death, and that is significant.

The police told Diane Parker you gotta do what you gotta do to protect yourself the best you can. She had concern what if he comes back, what if he comes back to my apartment. You're not going to find him. What if he comes back. And she had that serious concern, Now this case is not about Diane Parker. It's about my client, who's being charged with the murder of this homeless rapist who brutally raped,

1V-32

told the police she was afraid. She told the police this would get her killed, And she stated, If you don't catch him, I will be dead." She was afraid because he had threatened to kill her. She almost didn't tell the police but she did because he came back and she didn't want to go through what she went through on July 1,

Another coincidence. Two black eyes. What the prosecution didn't tell you when Duran Bailey was found, in addition to his carotid artery being severed, two black eyes, You be the judge of that significance.

She told the police she wanted protection. She said, "I know him," This is July ⁴1" when they're interviewing her. "I know him. I can show you where he lives. I know he's homeless but he lives next to the dumpster, Nevada State Bank, a block away." Because, after all, as indicated, they were having a sexual relationship in the past where they did, you'll hear evidence, exchange -- she would give him sex for cocaine, not methamphetamine that my client had a problem with in the past but cocaine. And when he raped and sodomized her on the 1st, as you can see, not voluntary. So despite the past sexual relationship for drugs, this was not a voluntary, consensual sexual episode. She called the police and she feared for her life.

She told the police, "I'm scared to walk outside my

beat and sodomized Diane Parker. Another injury. There's volume of them. And I don't want to overload you but I want to give you a taste of what the evidence that is coming your way is gonna show.

JUROR ANDERSON: I can't tell what we're looking at. I'm sorry.

MS, GREENBERGER: Oh, I'm sorry. That is the shoulder — $\,$

THE COURT: The record shall reflect that Tai Anderson, who is in chair Number 2, spoke.

MS, GREENBERGER: That is her right shoulder, a punch to the right shoulder. And there's also a video-camera up on that end, just so you know, although not the same size,

But so we have her right shoulder, black eyes on her fact, bruising to her arms. The black-and-blue on her neck is where the knife was held, right up there, and then some bruises to her legs. Unfortunately, Diane Parker was not as lucky as my client, was not able to free herself from the victim in this case, Duran Bailey.

What's important, my client was not in Las Vegas July 8th, 2001. That is when Duran Bailey was murdered. She has an alibi. She was 160 miles away. Multiple witnesses saw her in Panaca, Nevada before, during and after his death, and that's why I say July 2nd to July 9th because it's not, oh, she

<u>IV v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

just was there for the night. She was back in town, in Panaca, staying with her parents and multiple witnesses saw her. Phone records will confirm it. Again, don't take my word. This is what the evidence is going to show. July 2 nd through July 9th are the important dates. And he died on July 8th, 2001.

And I'm not certain that I finished with Diane Parker being at the crime scene, She did come to the crime scene, saw Duran Bailey, and then later was able to identify him, said This is the rapist Yes, this man that's lying here is the rapist."

So let's look at the physical evidence because the physical evidence speaks volumes in this case. DNA found at the crime scene, a piece of chewing gum on top of the blood that surrounded Duran Bailey tested two sources of DNA on the gum, two sources. One matches Duran Bailey, The other one remains unidentified. Just so you know, they took my client's DNA She gave it to them consensually, and we'll get into that, did not match her DNA.

This is eXtremely interesting, A pubic hair combing was done on the victim, homeless rapist, Duran Bailey's private area And the forensic lab said there's one hair that doesn't match the others. They were able to determine that. And so they did testing on the hair to see whose it could be. There were two sources of DNA on this hair, one Duran Bailey's, the

1V-34

sophisticated is a meth user who's on a three-day binge gonna be, So sophisticated we're gonna recruit someone like this to the special forces, not leave a trace, and evidence of other people that are unidentified? I don't think so. Ask yourself that

MR. KEPHART: Your Honor, I'm gonna object. She's making argument,

THE COURT: Sustained,

MS, GREENBERGER: Blood. There is no blood or other physical evidence anywhere. Where is the blood? She's covered in blood after she stabs this man. Where's the blood? There's no blood in her car. All of the confirmatory testing was negative. You are gonna hear testimony from a number of experts about luminol, about presumptive testing, about confirmatory testing, and you will hear testimony that you cannot clean up blood with ordinary chemicals that are accessible to us in the public. There was no blood found anywhere, no -- and they -- she voluntarily provided her car to them and said take it. She signed a consent,

Fingernail scrapings were done on my client, on the victim, fingerprint examinations were done. And the prosecution says, well, you know, her fingerprints weren't found on her vehicle, leading us to believe maybe there's no fingerprints. But let me tell you, there were plenty of

IV-36

other remains unidentified. The other excludes my client. And you will hear testimony on this from a number of experts.

When the prosecutor showed you pictures of the crime scene, and you will see plenty of them, I find this very interesting, there were two or at least two, let's say multiple, bloody shoe print impressions at the crime scene, one on the concrete, the other on a piece of cardboard. You'll hear testimony from the lead homicide detective in the case that the shoe print impressions appeared to be different and did not match my dient, Men's size 9, ladies size 10 equivalent. My client, Kirstin Blaise Lobato, wears a 7 and a half. And don't think they didn't seize her shoes because when the police did come to talk to my client about what she believed they were coming to talk to her about her attack, she said, "Yeah, these are the shoes I'm wearing. Take them, analyze them."

But that's not all, As I indicated, fortunately, I believe the crime scene was rich with evidence. There were tire track impressions at the scene. It appears, and you'll see pictures of them, they're directly outside of the gate, outside of the dumpster where he was found, significant enough that homicide crime scene analysts analyzed them. And they seized my client's car. They compared the tire tracks and, again, they exclude her vehicle. Ask yourself how

fingerprints in her car, not hers. But you're gonna wipe down the car and keep others but not have yours?

And a baseball bat. There's a bat found behind the seat of my client's car, analyzed by professionals, They spend their career trying to collect evidence. No evidence of blood on the baseball bat.

Another interesting point to take note of is that my client was attacked around Memorial Day and stabbed the attacker with a knife. You will hear evidence from a leading trauma surgeon from Stanford who has devoted his career to law enforcement in injury reconstruction. For example, when a mother brings her son into the emergency room and says he fell down the steps. Law enforcement comes to him and says check this out. So he began getting interested in forensic pathology, in addition to being a trauma surgeon, because he wanted to understand the nature of injuries, how do they occur. And he has analyzed the evidence in this case very carefully. You will hear testimony that Duran Bailey was not killed with a butterfly knife but scissors. His carotid artery was snipped. There are parallel injuries on his body that match scissor indentions [sic]. And he has measured my client's hand diameter, so he has been able to exclude her from yielding that weapon because the diameter of her hand size is smaller than the minimum width of the injuries on the scissors, so her

VV v. LOBATO 9/14/06

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

hand could not have been in the scissors that killed Duran Bailey, And he definitely will testify more eloquently than I explained it based on the science behind it all and his expertise.

The state pathologist in this case, Lary Simms, he examined the body. He will testify he says this crime was traditionally male-on-male, He has never been involved in a case involving this injury pattern in a female, Another important point to note.

Why are we here? My client was the victim of attempted sexual assault at least thirty days before this crime was committed She was a victim and she got away. Different victim, different crime, different location, different incident,

MR. KEPHART: Judge, I'm gonna object, She's arguing

THE COURT: Sustained,

MS. GREENBERGER: She escaped, unlike Diane Parker, No question she was suffering meth addiction at the ti me

MR, KEPHART: Judge, she is still arguing.

THE COURT: Sustained.

MS. GREENBERGER: The evidence will show —

MR, KEPHART: Judge, I'm gonna ask that she stop

making argument, that all of this point right here that she has

IV-38

she will be honest, you know, with you about what happened. 2 So the police show up at my client's house. She sees homicide detectives, and they ask or tell her, you know, we understand you've been a victim of crime, of assault. She starts to cry, fearing, fearing when she saw homicide detectives that the man that attacked her had died. And while she's crying she does say, "I didn't think someone would miss someone like that, a homeless rapist, a man that tried to rape me," She didn't think someone would miss someone that could do that to her. She did not confess to a crime, and the police never asked her did you kill the man, tell us details, where did it happen, when did it happen, And when she told the police and the police knew when they came to her. They had been Duran Bailey's crime scene. They knew exactly where it happened and they knew exactly when it happened. And she said to them, and you will hear testimony that was taped out of my client's mouth, "It was over a month ago," Over a month ago. Now she made that taped statement to the police July 20⁻⁻, 2001,

You will hear evidence that the police never continued the questioning at that time but turned the taperecorder off because she was eighteen years old, her parents were arriving and they did not pursue further questioning So, ladies and gentlemen, what we have and what the evidence

1V-40

on the board is argument,

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

5

8

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

MS, GREENBERGER: The evidence will show she told multiple people —

THE COURT: Overruled.

MS. GREENBERGER: -- inconsistent accounts. The prosecution told you you're gonna hear different stories. Well, that's true, because there's a lot of different stories. And I ask you to factor in meth addiction, how that affects reliability, dependability, pnsistency.

She was struggling with this attack, and she did confide in her school counselor. We'll hear from her, Dixie, as indicated by the prosecutor. She told her what had happened to her. And her counselor called her friend, who was a probation officer, who ultimately called the police. My client told her teacher, "I was the victim of the attack. This is what happened." She did not tell her I stabbed him in the neck. You will not hear that testimony. She said, like I explained, that she was pushed down, she pulled out a knife, she stabbed, fended off her attacker and left, and the man was standing, holding himself

When the police came to talk to my client on July 20th, because probation called police and asked are there any injured people in that area, in Las Vegas, the police came to talk to my client, And her teacher said if you go talk to her,

IV-39

will show is that my client made a voluntary statement explaining the attack. She told them it occurred at the Budget Suites on the east side of Vegas. She described the attacker as over 6 feet and 200 pounds, Duran Bailey, I don't know if I told you his measurements yet, he was 510", 130 pounds. Significant contrast in stature and weight, 510", 130 pounds is what the victim in this case was. Now when my client went to confide in her teacher she said, and you will hear testimony maybe today, a big man. A big man. Not 5'10" and 130 pounds, So what has happened, and you will hear evidence of, is her discussion with the police where she thought they were actually coming to talk to her about her attack has been twisted into a confession.

Let's look at what wasn't done. For some unknown reason, the Coroner's Office was told by homicide to stop the investigation, they would handle it, stop the investigation for the next of kin on Duran Bailey, we're doing our own investigation. You'd think and hope as many agencies as possible is gonna try to track down what happened. Ask yourself why was that.

Material evidence. Now this man was found next to a dumpster so there was a lot of material, but some of the most important material that was not collected, preserved or tested includes the plastic wrap that's around the man's body

IV v. LOBATO 9/14/06

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

in the lower regions, with blood all over it, you'll see pictures of it, and paper towels that were stuffed into his wound, his gaping wound from the postmortem dismemberment. You'll hear testimony from forensic analysts that say it would have had epithelial cells, would have been very, very helpful. Again, a crime scene rich in evidence. Why wasn't it tested? Ask yourself, And then there's some picture you'll see from the autopsy and testimony you'll hear about some cigarette butts on the body, again, not tested or preserved, And keep in mind, again, what was tested and preserved excludes her.

I mentioned this previously, but no followup investigation on the rape of Diane Parker, The DNA has never been matched. As we sit here today, five years have gone by since the commission of this crime, DNA has never been matched. The weapon, the murder weapon of Duran Bailey, has never been recovered. The real killer has never been pursued and remains at large.

Let's look at motive in this case because that's an important thing to 'examine. Diane Parker, brutally beaten and raped by Duran Bailey.

MR. KEPHART: Judge, I'm gonna object. She's going into argument again.

THE COURT: Sustained

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

fruition.

MS, GREENBERGER: The evidence will show my

1V-42

so the Court will, however, sustain the objection, 2 3

MS. DiGIACOMO: Thank you. But I'd just like to note for the record that her entire slide was up long enough for the jury to read some of it and it's not, according to her own statement, showing what the evidence would show,

MS. GREENBERGER: The evidence speaks for itself. My client has not motive, no opportunity. The evidence will show she has an alibi, no physical link to this crime.

Another important point, the evidence will show no physical injuries associated with this crime, The physical evidence excludes my client. Please look at the science. The scientific evidence will establish my client, Kirstin Blaise Lobato, is not guilty of the crime for which she stands charged.

Thank you,

THE COURT: The State may call their first witness, MR. KEPHART: May we approach the bench first, Your Honor?

THE COURT: Yes, you may.

(Off-record bench conference at 14:35:14 until 14:37:42)

THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, at this time you'll have a ten-minute stretch break. Please be in the hallway in ten minutes. The bailiff will meet you there to return you to your seats in the courtroom.

During this recess, you're admonished not to talk or

IV-44

client never met Duran Bailey, Diane Parker's rape occurred July 1'. Duran Bailey killed July 8 ", one week apart to the day. Location of rape, inside her apartment, a block from where the victim in this case, Duran Bailey's, body was found., Location of murder, a block from Diane Parker's apartment where Duran Bailey raped her, The knife used in the rape was held at Diane's carotid artery, vaginal rape, attempted sodomy. Bailey's cause of death due to severed carotid artery. Dismembered postmortem,

In this chart, the prosecution was asking you about coincidence. This chart, you know, illustrates what we think are some coincidences, Diane Parker reported being raped to police, identifies him as the rapist, Diane Parker present at crime scene, identifies body as her rapist And I put others had motive because I want to remind you that the friends that saw her getting slapped are the same friends that saw her after her attack, cannot ignore the injuries on her.

(Pause in the proceedings)

MS. GREENBERGER: This may or may not come to

MS. DiGIACOMO: Objection, Your Honor, MS. GREENBERGER: So I'll skip past it. The evidence in this case speaks for itself,

THE COURT: The record shall reflect she took it off,

converse amongst yourselves, nor with anyone else, on any subject connected with this trial, and you're not to read, watch or listen to any report of or commentary on the trial or any person connected with the trial, by any medium of information, including, without limitation, newspaper, television, radio and Internet, and you are not to form or express any opinion on any subject connected with the trial until the case is finally submitted to you.

We'll see you in ten minutes. You may exit at this timer

(Jurors recessed at 14:38:20)

THE COURT: The record shall reflect that the jury has exited.

From sidebar discussion, counsel wishes to make a motion on the record outside the presence of the jury at this time.

MR. KEPHART: Judge, during the defense opening statement, which we objected to numerous times as argument, she actually showed a slide that was entitled The State's Star Witness." And then she used the name -- I think, actually, it was "Prosecution's Star Witness." And it was on with regards to Korinda Martin. She paused. It sat up there for a period of time. Then she put Korinda Martin's name up there and then put on the rest of her points where -- calling

<u>\IV v.</u> LOBATO 9/14/06

her a pathological liar, other issues involving the previous case that we were -- the previous trial. We didn't mention her in our opening statement. We didn't present that we intended to present her to this jury Now we're in a situation where it appears to this jury that we're trying to hide something from them, that -- and the problem with this is is the period of time that this took and the way they started their comments to the jury was the event that she was wrongly accused in 2001 and now, here, she's twenty-three years old in 2006, and that's how they started that. And now we've got a situation where it appears that there's a period of time that we've taken over this five years, or whatever, to get her, to prosecute her, and then they put up this star prosecution witness after they went through a whole litany of things that the State didn't do, that the prosecution didn't do, that the cops didn't do, And it sat up in front of this jury. And I can tell you, sitting here watching them, every one of them watched that,

And I think at this point in time it has polluted this jury and the State is not gonna be able to get a fair trial here, And I'm gonna ask the Court to grant a mistrial on the actions that the defense presented on their own.

MR, SCHICK: Your Honor, in this case, as the Court will recall, we filed a motion long before trial to include the testimony of Korinda Martin on the basis that she was an

1V-46

asked co-counsel did they read Korinda Martin's name, and because I don't recall hearing it. Ms- Greenberger asked them here in court whether or not they had read Korinda Martin's name, and they said yes, oh, yes, we read Korinda Martin's name to the jury. And then Ms. DiGiacomo made some comments about how she was their star witness.

We had every reason to anticipate, and still don't know that they're not calling Korinda Martin as a witness, to put that slide before the jury. As soon as it became clear, Ms Greenberger panned through the bullet points that you have to go through in order, and I'm not a PowerPoint expert by any -- by any means, each point, bullet point, slides across the screen. You have to push the button that number of times to progress through the screen. And correct me if I'm wrong or the -- on the dynamics of how that happens, but you can't just push a button and make them all go away. You have to go through. And so, yes, it was on, it was on the screen for a period of time and it did say "Star Witness," but the defense had every reason to believe and had inquired that she was going to be a witness in this case and to have that in the PowerPoint presentation,

And just because the State didn't mention a witness in their opening statement, certainly, I don't believe means they're not going to call that witness. They did not mention a

IV-48

incredible witness, an admitted perjurer that has not been prosecuted and was simply not to be believed. The State opposed that motion and argued very strongly that they were going to -- that they could call Korinda Martin, even though she was a perjurer, that that was up to the jury to decide whether or not and what -- whether or not to believe her testimony despite those things. So we had sought to keep her off the stand long ago,

And it was the Supreme Court that referred to Korinda Martin as the State's "key witness," I believe is their exact term instead of star witness, but "key witness." And it was because of her importance and the fact that we were not allowed to impeach her at the first trial that they reversed the conviction, But they made a very specific point that without Korinda Martin the State did not have much of a case and, thus, any error was found to be harmful and not harmless. And that's the Supreme Court's language and opinion after reading the first trial.

During the reading of witnesses, the State had the option of not reading the name of Korinda Martin to the jury, yet they did to both panels. Her name was read to the jury,

THE COURT: To both groups,

MR, SCHIECK: To both groups. I missed, during the first group, that they said her name. I questioned and

lot of witnesses that we can anticipate are gonna be called in this case. And so there was certainly nothing intentional to cause a mistrial from the defense standpoint. And if the State feels that somehow the mentioning of Korinda Martin has somehow prejudiced them in the eyes of the jury, the jury can simply be instructed to ignore that slide. It's something they won't hear about for the rest of the case and, I'm sure, by the time this lengthy trial is over will have long forgotten the name Korinda Martin unless the State puts it back before them,

So we would oppose the motion for a mistrial MS, DiGIACOMO: And, Your Honor, if I could just make the record clear with regard to Korinda Martin, First of all, what the Supreme Court said in their opinion, that's the Supreme Court's opinion_ They're not the ones trying this case. Yes, yesterday we read the list of all possible witnesses and I said that to both panels. These are witnesses we may call. And they did ask me after the first panel, did you read that name, and I said, yes, I did. Ms. Greenberger asked me so are you calling Korinda Martin. And I looked at her and kind of shrugged my shoulders. And then after a few seconds, I did, and it was sarcastic, said, well, she's our star witness, isn't it -- isn't she, we have to, joking. I never indicated to them we were gonna call her.

And with regard to their motion, it's our position with

\IV v. LOBATO 9/14/06

their motion to exclude Korinda all along was that it's our position if we call her or not. And at this point, we could call her, we might not. They don't know. That's true. But what happened was when the slide was put up, Ms, Greenberger paused for quite a while looking, almost like a panic, like what do I do now If they think that we're calling her, she could have gone right on with her slide. If they think we weren't calling her, she has the option with the slide show to turn off the slide or hide it so it doesn't come up, It's the defense actions in front of the jury that makes it look suspicious, And if you recall yesterday, we kind of objected and brought up the fact of her PowerPoint, we didn't get to see it beforehand.

And so we'll submit it with that. But, you know, if they really thought we were calling her because we listed her, she could have gone right on with her PowerPoint But that's not what happened, She stopped and stared and kind of panicked in front of the jury and then flipped through it quickly and didn't know what to say.

MR. KEPHART: Your Honor, the concern that we have is it has put us at a disadvantage here, At this point in time in the time frame, as I had said earlier, from the time when she was originally arrested, originally tried and now has been quite a substantial time. We run the risk every time we have these type of retries that the jury is questioning what has

It appears to the Court that the State had not told the defense that they were definitely not going to call Korinda Martin, That may have put this situation in a far different posture than the one that the Court finds itself in at this time, where the defense has to -- and both sides when they make their opening statements are trying to anticipate what the evidence will be. And as we all know, in every trial there are always surprises, even in retrials, there are surprises when you get human beings on the witness stand under oath. And in the middle of the trial, some new evidence may come out that didn't come out before,

The reason why the Court sustained the objection to the Korinda Martin slide was because of the pathological liar list or bullet point on it, which the Court felt was a conclusion, was argument and was invading the providence that the jury is -- the jury is to determine the weight and the credibility of the witness. And I felt that that was an inappropriate bullet point.

The Court finds that the relief sought is extreme and not warranted here and, therefore, denies the motion for a mistrial.

And I'm gonna step down and allow the bailiff to reseat the jury, and then the State --

MS. DiGIACOMO: Can we have a bathroom break? THE COURT: — will be able to call their first witness,

IV-52

happened, what went on before, why has it taken so long to prosecute Now we have this situation where they sit here and they watch something that was supposedly called the star witness and then now, if we don't call her, they're certainly gonna be wondering what's going on with regards to what was put up there on the -- up there on the screen and what they saw. And it's certainly made it an unfair proceeding for the State here, We're entitled to a fair trial, just like the defense is, and they have not -- they have not given us that. They have made a they have caused a problem with this jury that I'm in a situation where I need to ask for a mistrial and we need to start with a new jury.

THE COURT: Every single person on the jury knows what today's date is. And the State began their opening statement by stating the date of the offense as July 2001. All of the testimony that's gonna come in through the various witnesses is all going to relate to events that occurred in 2001, So nothing that the defense did is going to cause the jury to have concern there. That's just the facts. Those are just the dates, the way it exists. You know, the jury's told that they're not to speculate about things as to which there is no evidence, and I assume that that instruction will be included in the -- in the standard packet that the parties will be presenting at the close of evidence.

Mr. Bailiff, if you would -- if you would wait about two minutes before you go get the jury.

THE BAILIFF: Yes, I will.

THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

We'll go off the record.

gentlemen of the jury panel.

(Court recessed at 14:51:27 until 15:05:01)

(Jurors are present)

THE BAILIFF: All rise, please.

Department II is back in session. Please be seated THE COURT: The record shall reflect that we're resuming trial in State versus Kirstin Lobato under Case Number C177394, in the presence of the defendant, her three counsel, the two prosecuting attorneys, and the ladies and

We are proceeding forward now with the State's case in chief. And the State may call the State's first witness,

MR. KEPHART: Thank you, Your Honor. At this time, Your Honor, we're gonna be calling Richard Shott and we'll be reading his testimony in. A gentleman from my office is present for that.

I'd like the record to reflect that this is his testimony that he gave back in April of 2002.

THE COURT: Very well.

MR, KEPHART: In a previous proceeding.

6

8

9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

6

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

SHOTT - DIRECT SHOTT - DIRECT THE COURT: Could the reader state his name for 1 MR. KEPHART: Your Honor, for purpose of the the record? 2 hearing here, III just go through and read it, MR STAUDAHER: Michael Staudaher, 3 BY MR. KEPHART: S-T-A-U-D-A-H-E-R 4 "Q I'm showing what's been marked as Proposed 5 THE COURT: Thank you, Exhibit Number 4 and ask you if you'd seen what we're talking 6 MR, KEPHART: Your Honor, it starts out from the about when you're talking about the dumpster and then a 7 transcript, the clerk actually reads the portion of that. So bunch of garbage behind the dumpster., THE CLERK: "Please state your name, your full 8 "A That could have been that. Yes, 9 And I'm going to show you Proposed Exhibit name, for the record and spelling your last name, please. THE WITNESS: "Richard Shott, S-H-O-T-T." 10 Number 6 and ask you if you can identify that. Take a good RICHARD SHOTT, STATE'S WITNESS, BY DEPOSITION 11 look at it. Go ahead. You can hold it. **DIRECT EXAMINATION** 12 "A Yes. "O BY MR. KEPHART: 13 Okay, Have you seen that before? "Q Sir, I want to draw your attention back to July 8th of 14 "A last year, 2001, ask you if you were here in Las Vegas on that 15 "Q Okay, You've never seen this photo before? day, 16 "A "A Yes, I was 17 "Q Okay. This is the area, however, that you described "Q Okay Specifically around 10:00 o'clock that night 18 just -- just now about finding a body behind a dumpster. Is did you have an opportunity to be in the area 19 that correct? of Flamingo, West Flamingo, near a Nevada State Bank 20 "A Yes. building around that same time? "Q Okay, Did you move anything before you actually 21 "A Yes, I was. 22 saw the body? "Q Okay, Can you tell us what you were doing? 23 Yes. I believe I moved some papers and a box, a "A Dumpster diving. 24 cardboard box, and then that's when I noticed his stomach. IV-54 IV-56 SHOTT - DIRECT SHOTT - DIRECT "Q And what is that, so we know? 1 "Q Okay. Is this photo, State's Proposed Exhibit 2 Number 6, does that show a photo of a cardboard box and "A Going through the dumpster, looking for 3 papers, obviously? merchandise, recyclable aluminum cans, whatever. "Q Okay. And do you specifically remember what 4 "A Okay. And would it be the cardboard box that 5 dumpster it was that you were looking through on that night when something caused you to be here testifying today? 6 you're talking about or maybe that you moved? 7 "A Maybe so, "A Oh, yes, A body, a dead body. 8 "Q Okay, Tell me where you were when you saw a "O Okay, And once you saw that there was a body 9 there, what did you do? dead body. "A I was behind the dumpster, well, behind in back of 10 "A I say to myself I gotta get out of here, 11 "0 Okay. it, "Q Behind the dumpster? 12 "A "A Yes, 13 Okay. And did you just get out of there or did you "0 "Q Okay. 14 do something else? 15 "A In back of it. "A I just left. "Q What drew your attention to the body? 16 "O Okay. And what was it — you didn't talk to "A I seen there was -- I'd already rotted through the 17 anybody? dumpster inside and I noticed that there was a bunch of 18 No. I went up to the gas station and -- to use the 19 phone. But it took me about two and a half hours garbage behind it, not in the dumpster, so I went behind there Okay, and moved a box. And I thought I seen a sneaker, but it 20 "Q "A -- to make the phone call, 911 call. 21 wasn't. And as I moved, I seen a black stomach of a body, "Q Okay. And what gas station did you go to? MR, KEPHART: "Okay, May I approach, Your 22 Honor? 23 "A Terrible Herbst, Where is that located? Do you know the names of THE COURT: "Yes." 24 24

IV-57

v LOBATO		9/14/06
SHUTT - DIRECT		SHOTT - DIRECT
the streets?	1	"Q Uh-huh.
"A Arville and Flamingo. It's like maybe a half a block	2	"A Yeah, I didn't go all the way back there,,
west.	3	"Q Okay, But you moved. Did you move the box
"Q Okay. And why did it take you two and a half hours	4	enough to where you could see under it?
	5	"A I seen the I seen a stomach, yeah,
·	6	"Q Okay, And what did you do with the box? Just put
	7	it back down?
	8	"A I yeah. I dropped everything,
		"Q Okay. And got got the heck out of there?
		"A Yes.
		"Q Okay, And you said that you didn't see anybody
	1	else in there?
		"A Nor
		"Q Do you know a person by the name of St. Louis or
		Duran, um, that hung around there?
		"A Knew him because a couple of days later I went to a
		couple of different homeless camps and —
		·
		"Q Okay, "A put the word out, And that's how I found out that
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
		there was a body. That was the dead body, St, Louis.
		"Q Okay. But you did you didn't know him to see. If
		you looked at him, wouldn't you have recognized him or
	1	anything?
"Q Okay.	24	"A I might have seen him a couple of times coming
IV-58		IV-60
SHOTT - DIRECT		SHOTT - CROSS
"A And they sent officers to where I was, I told the	1	from the Gold Coast Casino,
	2	"Q So you've seen him in the area at least?
wait for the cops,	3	"A Yes.
"Q And they showed up?	4	"Q Okay, When the police got there, did you tell them
"A Yes.	5	everything that you just told us here now?
"Q And you actually walked around in the area where	6	"A Yes,
	7	"Q Didn't see anybody running from the scene or
"A Walked around.	8	anything like that?
		"A No.
		MR. KEPHART: "We'll pass the witness, Your
		Honor."
	1	CROSS-EXAMINATION
		BY MR. SCHIECK:
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		"Q How are you, Mr, Shott?
_		"A Oh, a little nervous,
		"Q I'm not going to ask you anything hard.
, , ,		"A Okay.
		"Q Mr. Kephart showed you this picture which is
<u> </u>	1	marked Exhibit 6, Is that familiar to you?
		"A Yes, I've just seen it.
		"Q And is that what the body looked like to you when
		you got there?
	i	"A All I seen was the stomach,
Wall.	24	"Q Okay. Now there was a trash can here then, right?
IV-59		IV-61
	the streets? "A Arville and Flamingo. It's like maybe a half a block west. "Q Okay. And why did it take you two and a half hours to use the phone? "A 'Cause I didn't know what to do, "Q Okay. Did you talk to anybody else? "A No, "Q Okay. In that area, is there an area that — that you frequent? Is this an area that you frequent? Is this an area that you frequent? "A Yes. "Q Okay. Did you see anybody else around there when you— "A No, I didn't. "Q How is it that you got into the dumpster area? "A I noticed that the gate was unlocked and open a little bit, and usually it's locked. "Q Okay. Arid on this particular night that it was open? "A I checked it out "Q Okay. All right. And when you called the police, what did you tell the police? "A Well, I called 911 and told them I think I found a dead body, "Q Okay. IV-58 SHOTT - DIRECT "A And they sent officers to where I was, I told the lady at 911 that I couldn't go nowhere, I'd sit right here and wait for the cops, "Q And you actually walked around in the area where the body was in the — was, is that right? "A Walked around. "Q Well, you were in the area where the body was? "A Behind the dumpster? "Q Uh-huh, "A No "Q You weren't in there? How did you move the box? "A Well, I went behind the — in back of the dumpster, "Q That's what I mean. "A Only right there because there was like a long ways to the end where the box is. "Q Uh-huh. "A Where the dumpster is. "Q Okay. "A I only got to where — at the end of the dumpster. "Q I got you "A You know, where there was like 4 to 6 feet to the wall.	the streets? "A Arville and Flamingo. It's like maybe a half a block west. "Q Okay. And why did it take you two and a half hours to use the phone? "A 'Cause I didn't know what to do, "Q Okay. Did you talk to anybody else? "A No, "Q Okay. In that area, is there an area that — that you frequent? Is this an area that you frequent? Is this an area that you frequent? Is this an area that you got into the dumpster area? "A Yes. "Q Okay. Did you see anybody else around there when you— "A No, I didn't. "Q How is it that you got into the dumpster area? "A I noticed that the gate was unlocked and open a little bit, and usually it's locked. "Q Okay. Arid on this particular night that it was open? "A I checked it out "Q Okay. All right. And when you called the police, what did you tell the police? "A Well, I called 911 and told them I think I found a dead body, "Q Okay. IV-58 SHOTT - DIRECT "A And they sent officers to where I was, I told the lady at 911 that I couldn't go nowhere, I'd sit right here and wait for the cops. "Q And you actually walked around in the area where the body was in the — was, is that right? "A Walked around. "Q Well, you were in the area where the body was? "A Behind the dumpster? "Q Uh-huh, "A No "Q You weren't in there? How did you move the box? "A Well, I went behind the — in back of the dumpster, "Q That's what I mean. "A Only right there because there was like a long ways to the end where the box is. "Q Uh-huh, "A Where the dumpster is. "Q Okay. "A I only got to where — at the end of the dumpster. "Q I got you "A You know, where there was like 4 to 6 feet to the wall.

v OBATO 9/14/06

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18 19

21

22

10

11

14

16

17

19

20

21

22

SHOTT - CROSS SHOTT CROSS "A Yes. "A Yeah, took an imprint. 2 "Q Okay. But they didn't take your shoes away from "Q That's not here in this photo, There's the trash can you? in State's Number 4. Is that more what it looked like when 3 4 you got there? "A No, they did not. "A No. It was -- this was like this a way. I think, and it 5 "Q Did you look at your shoes? 6 "A When I took them off, was cocked, 7 "Q It was moved a little bit, to the best of your "Q Specifically, did you look for blood? Did you see recollection? 8 blood on them? 9 9 "A Yeah. "A I don't think so. I don't think so. "Q Okay. But the scene -- but the -- may I show the 10 "Q So what did — was it really two and a half hours? I mean, how do you know it was two and a half hours? It just jury?" 11 THE COURT: You want to publish the --12 seemed like it, like that, or was it really that long? MR. SCHIECK: And at this point, I believe 4 and 6 13 "A It seemed like that, were admitted into evidence, 14 "Q Because you called around 10:30, right? 15 "A Yes. MR, KEPHART: Yeah, 16 MR, SCHIECK: And I can just go to the next 16 "Q I believe the 911 tape came in, and there will be evidence later, 10:36. Does that make sense to you? question. 17 "A Yes, It's been a while. It's been almost like a year, BY MR. SCHIECK: 18 "Q So it looked like that. And the body had some □ 19 "Q Right. But when you left, so before you found the cardboard over it like you've seen, like you described in picture body you left the Gold Coast, Do you remember, was it dark 20 20 6? 21 out yet, was it dusk, was it light? Do you remember? 22 "A Was sort of a little dark because I was in there for "A Yes. 23 like five or six hours. 23 Did you at any time go in that back corner, back left "Q Do you know what I mean when I say dusk, you corner? 24 1V-62 IV-64 SHOP' - CROSS know, somewhere, you know, in a twilight, sometimes "A No. 2 between, you know, when it's light out and the sun goes "Q On the other side of the body? 2 3 down? Could it have been around that time? "A No 4 "A Urn. "Q You didn't go anywhere near there, did you? "Q If you don't remember, sir. "A I don't remember. "Q What did you do for two and a half hours? 6 7 "Q Did you take anything away from the dumpster "A Debated whether or not to call it, make the phone call and report it. But then to cover myself, you know, if 8 area? 9 "A No, I did not. someone were to put me around that area then you'd be 10 "Q Did you leave anything there? looking for me for questioning, you know what I mean, and 11 "A If I had anything in my hand, I probably did, gave me the body, or whatever, but then do the right thing 12 "Q Do you know what it was? What would you have 12 because I do have a conscience. 13 had in your hand? 13 "Q You were interviewed by the police that night? 14 "A I don't remember, "A Yes. MR, SCHIECK: "I have no further questions." 15 "Q Were you wearing the exact, same clothes when the 15 MR. KEPHART: Judge, I believe at this time that we police talked to you as when you found the body? 16 17 had moved to admit 4, 5 and 6, but I haven't got to 5 yet. So "A Yes 18 I'll move to admit 4 and -- 4 and 6, "Q Did the police look at the bottom of your feet? 18 19 Thanks. 20 MR. SCHIECK: No objection. "Q Did they release you? 21 THE COURT: 4 and 6 are admitted. "A Yes. 22 (State's Exhibit Nos, 4 and 6 admitted) "Q They didn't arrest you? MR, KEPHART: The State would call Leuron 23 "A No. 23 24 Williams, Your Honor. "Q Did they take your shoes? 24

IV-65

N v. LOBATO WILLIAMS - DIRECT THE COURT: Would counsel approach? MR. KEPHART: Oh, okay, (Off-record bench conference at 15:16:55 until 15:17:55) THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, before Richard Shott gave the testimony that was just read to you, he was sworn and placed under oath in open court. 7 The State may proceed with the State's second 8 witness, 9 MR. KEPHART: Yeah. Lueron Williams, Your Honor. 10 THE COURT: Okay, 11 THE CLERK: Please come all the way forward. 12 Remain standing and raise your right hand, 13 LUERON WILLIAMS, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN 14 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. State 15 your name and spell it for the record, please, 16 THE WITNESS: Be seated? 17 THE COURT: Yes, you may be seated. 18 THE WITNESS: Lueron Williams, L-U-E-R-O-N, 19 THE COURT: The State may proceed, 20 DIRECT EXAMINATION 21 BY MR. KEPHART: 22 Q Ms, Williams, do you know an individual by the -- did 23 you know an individual by the name of Duran Bailey? 24 Yes, I did IV-66 WILLIAMS - DIRECT Okay. What's your relationship, if anything, with 2 him? 3 A He's my cousin, 4 Okay. I'm gonna draw your attention back to July of 5 2001 and ask you if you were called upon by the Las Vegas 6 Metropolitan Police Department to identify him, if you could were called in to identify him, 8 Yes, I was, 9 And can you tell me how long, if you know, did he live in Las Vegas prior to July 8th of 2001? 10 11 A He moved here in November, 1997 with his mother, 12 Q Okay, And were you living here in Las Vegas then? 13 A No. I didn't live here at that time, 14 When was it that you came to Las Vegas? 15 A I moved here in June, 1999. 16 Okay, And did Duran stay here in Las Vegas during 17 the time that he had moved here initially until his death? 18 A Yes, he did. 19 Did he also have a nickname? Was he known as St, 20 Louis? 21 Not that I knew of, 22 Okay.

But he was from St, Louis.

Now, are you familiar with the Nevada State Bank

IV-67

23

24

'IMAMS - DIRECT building located on West Flamingo across the street from the Palms? A Yes, I am, Q Okay, And how is it that you're familiar with that building? A Well, because I've taken him over there to the bank several times, quite a few times.

Q When you say him, are you talking about Duran?

Duran, Yes,

Okay, And so you had -- he had business at that bank?

Α Yes, he did,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

24

2

3

4

5

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

22

23

Okay. And you said that you took him over to that bank. Did he have transportation while he was here in Las Vegas?

A No. He had no transportation. He usually rode the city bus, I guess if what you call it,

Q Okay, And do you know if Duran worked?

19 A No, he didn't work. He was disabled.

Q Okay. And did he collect disability?

21 A Yes, he did. It's SSI,

22 Q And you said that he had business with the bank.

23 What type of business would he conduct with the bank?

A Well, he had a check that was going to -- going to

IV-68

WILLIAMS - DIRECT

the bank each month, his social security supplement. So, therefore, he had an account with that bank.

Q Okay, And did you know if Duran carried his license with him, driver's license? Did he have a driver's license?

A No. he had no driver's license but he did have a DMV state I.D. Because when I came in 1999, his mother has asked me to take him down to DMV to get another one. He had one in the past but he was always misplacing it. So, therefore, several things that he had to do when he needed ID,, he didn't have one, so I took him down to DMV one day to get another state 1.D,

Q Did you find out that when he was found, before you had to identify his body, that he did not have any I.D. on him?

A Well, I did find out, yes, that he didn't

Q Was that surprising to you?

A Well, no, because I know that several times I've taken him to the bank, you know, he didn't have 1,D, and kind of wondered how he was gonna withdraw without I.D., but he did.

20 Q He was able to conduct business there without a 21 bank — without his ID.?

A Yes, he was because he went there so often, like two and three times a day, that they were -- all of the clerks who worked in there was familiar with him.

V v. LOBATO 9/14/06

9 10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

WILLIAMS - DIRECT

Q Do you know or do you remember whether or not he had a stable home where he had a place to stay?

A Well, up until his mother passed away in May, 2000 he did. And the last time that I seen him because, like I say, he had income and he had told me on that day that he was — MR. SCHIECK: Objection, hearsay, what he said, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Sustained,

BY MR. KEPHART:

Q Without telling us what he had told you, my question is is did he have a place to stay, if you knew, back in July of 2001?

A 2001. No Not that I knew of.

Q Okay. Ma'am, I need to --

MR. KEPHART: May I approach, Your Honor?

THE COURT: Yes, you may,

BY MR KEPHART:

Q I need to show you a photograph, and we have it marked as a State's exhibit, Proposed Exhibit Number 40, and ask you if you could take a look at that and tell me if you recognize who that photo was taken of?

A Yes. That's Duran Bailey.

Q Okay. When was the last time that you saw Duran Bailey prior to July 8th of 2001?

IV-70

1 2 3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

cousin, right? A Yes.

Q And were you close with his mother? Was that that would your aunt then?

ILLIAMS - CROSS

A Well, I was close to her but I traveled a lot because we were in the military. So whenever I came back to St. Louis, you know, I got a chance to see her. So we were pretty

Q And did you ever, when she was still with us and when Duran was with us, did you ever have holidays together with them that you recall in Las Vegas?

A Oh, yes, we did. Yes, quite a few. All of the holidays, a matter of fact,

Q Had you ever visited either your aunt or your cousin at the Grandview Apartments?

A Yes, I did.

Q And you're aware that the Grandview Apartments were approximately a block away from the Nevada State Bank that you referred to?

A Yes.

Q How often would you estimate that you saw Mr, Bailey? Was it weekly, monthly, if you can recall?

A Well, after I moved here in '99, matter of fact, I would see them probably about every day because we were

IV-72

WILLIAMS - CROSS

A I seen him the month before, on June the 12. And I remember the exact date simply because I had to go to the social security office because I had misplaced my social security card. And when I arrived there, he was sitting in one of the seats there. And I went over and sat beside him and began to talk to him, A matter of fact, I talked to him all the way up until they called me,

MR, KEPHART: Okay. The Courts indulgence, Your Honor.

(Pause in the proceedings)

MR. KEPHART: Pass the witness, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Cross.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS ZALKIN:

Q Good afternoon, Ms. Williams. Where were you residing prior to moving to Las Vegas in 1999?

A Anchorage, Alaska.

Q Did you move here, in part, because you had some family members here?

A No. I moved here because my husband was retiring for a second time.

Q And what was he retiring from?

A From the State of Alaska Department of Corrections.

Q Were you close with -- so Duran Bailey was your

WILLIAMS - CROSS

waiting for them to finish building the house that we were gonna move in. So we had nothing else to do but just drive down to see them, visit.

Q So you weren't staying with them at the Grandview Apartments that you were --

A No, we weren't staying with them,,

Q Did Duran ever stay at your place once the -- once your home was ready?

A No.

10 Q Did he ever ask to?

> A No, because he lived with his mother during that time.

And do you recall, do you know why she had to move out of the apartment building, Grandview?

MR. KEPHART: Your Honor, I'm gonna object as to relevance.

MS. ZALKIN: It's —

THE COURT: Counsel, approach,

(Off-record bench conference at 15:28:10 until 15:28:46)

THE COURT: The objection is sustained,

BY MS. ZALKIN:

Q Do you know why he would make several trips in one day to the bank?

A Yes.

IV-71

IV <u>v. LOBATO 9/14/06</u>

1

3

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Okay.

24

19

20

21

22

23

24

Q And why is that?

A Because he'd only withdraw small amount of monies,

Q You testified that you last saw him in June at the social security office, is that correct?

A That's correct.

Q And that was just a coincidence that you ran into him?

A Yes, it's a coincidence. He had an appointment that day, and I just happened to go by there to get an application for a lost social security card.

Q Do you recall what, without telling us the substance, do you recall what the nature of your discussion with him was that day?

A Yes, We talked about he had recently come back from St. Louis, from his home town where he was born, and we talked about that And then we talked about him getting an application to get on with Section 8 or HUD or whatever the program is.

Q Had you ever met a former girlfriend of his named Debra?

A I can't recall the girl's name. When I came here in 1998, I met a young lady but I don't recall her name,

Q Okay. Do you recall a friend of his at one time named Diane Parker?

IV-74

WILLIAMS - CROSS

s, 2

Q And did he and your husband get along? Did they have any relationship?

A My husband was sick at the time so, therefore, you know, they talked when we by there.

/ILLIAMS - CROSS

Q You were aware that he had a problem with crack cocaine addiction?

A No, I wasn't aware that he had crack cocaine because if he did,, he never used all of his money for that, So I didn't know how he was getting it and I doubt if somebody was giving it to him.

Q Did you know a friend of his named Boogie Man?

A No, I knew none of his friends,

Q You never heard him mention a gentleman who went by the name of Smoke?

A No.

MS. ZALKIN: Court's indulgence. I'm nearly finished.

(Pause in the proceedings)

BY MS, ZALKIN:

Q Do you know, Ms. Williams, why he ended up homeless?

A Well, because the apartment was in his mother's name. It wasn't in his. And it was one of these senior citizen's apartments so, therefore, he wasn't fifty-five so he couldn't live

IV-76

WILLIAMS - CROSS

A The name doesn't ring a bell.

Q And so you testified that he had a place to live until his mother passed away. So as far as you knew, he was in between residences and was homeless on the date of his death. Is that accurate?

A Well, I do know that I kind of kept in touch with him through a friend who lived next door to my cousin over there in those apartments. His name was Carl. And every day he would check with Carl. He would come by there. And I would tell Carl to have him to call me. So, you know, he came by ironed his clothes and took a shower, and things like that.

Q So was he staying with Carl or just over there during the day, as far as you know?

A Yeah, just over there during the day. He would stop by and do various little things like that and then call my aunt in St Louis.

Q And so you're aware that he was sleeping in the parking lot area of the bank around the time of his death?

A I didn't know about the parking lot of the bank, but I know sometimes up under that Flamingo bridge, I guess, down up under there, I'd never been down there, of course, But I guess up under there people sleeps and stayed. So I thought at times, you know, that that's where he was because I guess he may have told Carl that

WILLIAMS - REDIRECT

there.

MS. ZALKIN: The Court's indulgence one more time Nothing further. Thank you very much.

MR. KEPHART: I do.

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. KEPHART:

Q Ms. Williams, the apartment that we're talking about where he was living with his mother, where is that located in reference to the bank that you used to take him to?

A Well, it's been a long time since I've been over in that area and I'm not really that familiar with it anymore. I know it's down past Flamingo. Oh, I don't even know the name of those other streets over in there.

Q Is it adjacent directly behind the bank?

A It's been a long time I can't even place where it is over on that side of town.

Q Okay. What was the name of the apartments, do you remember? Do you know the --

A The apartments?

Q Do you remember the name of the apartments?

A Yeah, the Grandview, I think it was.

MR, KEPHART: Okay. Nothing further, Your Honor,

THE COURT: Further cross.

137

WILLIAMS - RECROSS

MS. ZALKIN: Just one further question. □

RECROSS EXAMINATION

BY MS ZALKIN:

Q You would agree that the bank is approximately one block from the Grandview Apartments. Is that accurate? Maybe two blocks, a block or two?

A Maybe something like that because I would drop him off like on my way back home, you know, so just around the corner or right out of the area of the apartments where they lived, you know, and then over to the bank. And then I would just go on home.

Q So it was walking distance, certainly?

A Yeah, I would say walking distance.

MS. ZALKIN: Thank you. Nothing further.

THE COURT: Anything further by the State?

MR, KEPHART: Not by the State, Your Honor.

THE COURT: You may step down,

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

THE COURT: The State may call their next witness,

MR, KEPHART: Thank you, Your Honor. lain

Anderson.

THE CLERK: Please come all the way forward. Remain standing, raise your right hand.

IAIN ANDERSON, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN

IV-78

ANDERSON - DIRECT

THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. State your name and spell it for the record, please.

THE WITNESS: lain Anderson, I-A-I-N

A-N-D-E-R-S-O-N

THE COURT: The State may proceed.

MR KEPHART: Thank you, Your Honor,

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. KEPHART:

Q Mr. Anderson, I'm gonna draw your attention back to July of 2001 and ask you if you recall whether you were here in Las Vegas during that -- during that month,

A I was, sir,

Q Okay, And how were you employed?

A At the Palms Casino Resort —

Q And --

A -- as security,

Q As what?

A Security, I was an assistant security, Well, I was working for the Human Resources Department at the time.

Q I'm showing what's been marked as State's Proposed Exhibit Number 1, Can you -- can you see that on the -- well, what happened there? Oh, there it goes. Can you see that?

A Yes, sir.

21

22

23

24

Q Are you familiar with that property right there?

IV-79

1DERSON - DIRECT

A Sorry?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

19

20

21

22

23

24

Q Are you familiar with that property there?

A It's the Nevada State Bank, directly across from the Palms Casino.

Q Okay. And I'm showing you State's Proposed Exhibit Number 121 and ask you if you can just look this way, Can you see that as well, in this one? Do you see that?

A Yes, sir.

Q Okay. Does this have the actual bank building, the parking lot, all the adjoining properties?

A Yes

Q And does this accurately depict as you recall the property to be —

A At that time, yeah.

Q -- back in July, 2001?

A Ye

MR, KEPHART: Move to admit 121, Your Honor,

MR. SCHIECK: No objection, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Granted.

(State's Exhibit No. 121 admitted)

BY MR, KEPHART:

Q And on Exhibit Number 1, Proposed Exhibit Number 1 here, that's just basically the front of the bank, is that right?

A Yes,

IV-80

ANDERSON - DIRECT

MR, KEPHART: I'd move to admit —

THE WITNESS: The sign,

MR. KEPHART: — Proposed Exhibit Number 1,

MR. SCHIECK: No objection,

MR. KEPHART: Okay.

THE COURT: Granted.

(State's Exhibit No. 1 admitted)

BY MR, KEPHART:

Q Now, Mr. Anderson, the -- on the bank of the Exhibit 121 there's a yellow marker there. It says "Crime Scene." And it goes down to an area right at the -- I guess it would be the north end of that parking awning there.

A Yes.

Q Do you see where it's pointing to?

A Yes

Q Are you familiar with that area?

17 A There was a dumpster located there.

Q Okay, Showing you what's been marked as State's

Proposed Exhibit Number 117. Do you see that?

A Yes, sir.

Q Does that look familiar to you?

A Yes.

Q Does that accurately depict the dumpster area of — located at that bank?

<u>∨</u> OBATO 9/14/06

ANDERSON - DIRECT **IDERSON - DIRECT** A Yes. Q Okay. Okay_ 116. Does that also show it from a different 2 A But it had to be -- the lock was removed so that both 2 3 angle? 3 the bank and the Palms could use the same dumpster. 4 4 Q Do you remember how the lock was removed? A Yes, sir. 5 Q 119. 5 A No, I'm not aware of it, A Yes. 6 Q Okay. You weren't involved in doing that yourself? Q It actually shows across to the Palms, is that correct? 7 7 Q Okay. But you knew that both the bank and Palms Q 118. I show -used that -9 9 10 A Yes, 10 A Yes, 11 Q Does that accurately depict it as well? Okay. And 11 Q -- particular dumpster area? then this 120 shows down towards the Gold Coast and the Rio, 12 A Yes, sir, 12 13 is that right? Q Okay. I'm showing you what's been admitted as 13 14 A Yes. 14 State's Exhibit Number 4 and ask you if you recognize what 15 Q Okay, With regards to Exhibit 117, drawing your 15 that photo depicts. attention back to July 8th of 2001, that's -- that was a Sunday, A The inside of the enclosure. 16 16 17 Do you recall whether or not the bank or the business that you 17 Q Okay, And do you see back behind the dumpster there appears to be — well, what does it appear to you? 18 were working for security was open on those days, on that 18 19 A Trash, 19 day? A We were closed on the weekend. 20 Q And now I'm showing you State's Exhibit Number 6. 20 Now, does that also appear to be trash? 21 So Saturday and Sunday you would be closed? 21 22 22 A Yes, sir. Okay, Specifically, did you have anything to do with 23 Q Okay. Now the — you said that the particular 23 24 the bank itself? 24 dumpster area shared both, I guess, dumping garbage for P1-82 IV-84 ANDERSON - DIRECT ANDERSON - DIRECT A No. both you and the bank? Q But you had a business located within the bank A Yes, 2 O For the Palms — 3 building, is that right? 3 A Within the building, yeah. A Yes. Q And were you ever — did you ever use this particular Q -- Casino and the bank? So I'm showing you what's 5 dumpster in that area? been marked as State's Proposed Exhibit Number 7 or, 6 actually, it's in this photo right here. Do you see what appears A We shared that with the bank? 7 to be some palms right there? Q You shared it with the bank? 8 8 9 A Yes. 9 A Yes. Q Okay, And on the photo that's up in front of you, it Q So that would be consistent with something, maybe 10 10 garbage being deposited there from the Palms Casino? shows that there is a gate on the bank, on the -- I mean, on 11 12 the dumpster area. Is that -- do you see that? 12 A Yes, sir, 13 Q Okay. And now I'm showing you State's Proposed 13 A Yes, 14 Q Okay, Do you recall during that particular weekend, 14 Exhibit Number 11. Do you see there appears to be some the 7th would be a Saturday, the 8th would be a Sunday, do paperwork there with some writing on it? 15 15 you recall whether in July of that period of time there was any 16 A Yes. 16 17 type of locks or anything like that on the bank to -- I mean, on 17 Q There's also some looks -- appears to be some paper that's been shredded? 18 the -- I keep saying bank, on the gate to the dumpster area? 18 A Initially, there had been when we first moved into the 19 A Yes, sir, 19 20 building. But when we --20 Q Does that appear to be consistent with something that may be deposited there by the bank? 21 Q And when was that? 21 22 A Most likely, 22 A June, Q Okay. And you -- had you, yourself, ever deposited 23 Q Okay. A month previous? 23 any garbage there? A A month prior. 24 24

IV-85

ANDERSON - DIRECT **IDERSON - DIRECT** Yesindividual by the name of Duran Bailey, an individual that may Q Okay. Now with regards to Exhibit Number 6, there 2 have been living there, staying in that particular dumpster appears to a cardboard box, boxes, some air filter or air-3 area? 4 conditioning up there on the left, my left, 4 A Not to my recollection_ A Yes. 5 Q Okay. Now you were security for the Palms Hotel, is 6 Q Yeah, the photo's left Plastic bags or, actually, a cup that right? 6 down here. 7 7 A Yes, sir. At that time, yes. 8 MR. SCHIECK: Your Honor, could we ask the 8 Q Would it have been your job to keep people from 9 witness what is in the picture instead staying in there? 9 10 MR KEPHART: I'm — A Yes, 10 11 MR. SCHIECK: -- of Mr. Kephart? 1/ Q Okay Let me ask you this question. When was the 12 MR. KEPHART: That's fine. last time that you recall having anything to do with that 12 BY MR. KEPHART: 13 13 dumpster, the business? 14 Can you kind of tell — 14 A It would be Friday night. 15 THE COURT: Do you have an objection? 15 Q Okay. So 'cause the -- both the Palms, the Palms MR. SCHIECK: Yes, objection, Your Honor. I'm 16 16 division you were working with, and the bank were closed on 17 sorry. 17 the weekends? THE COURT: Sustained. 18 18 A I know we were_ I don't believe -- I'm not sure if the 19 BY MR. KEPHART: 19 bank was or not. 20 Q What do you -- what do you think? What does it 20 Q Okay. Well, do you have anything to do with Friday 21 appear to you is in that photo with regards to garbage? night there? That's what my question — 21 22 A A couple of boxes, plastic bags full of trash, the filters 22 A Friday night, yes, 23 for the air-conditioning. 23 Q What would have been your task? Q Okay Anything else? 24 24 A I was the last one to leave that day, made sure that IV-86 IV-88 ANDERSON - DIRECT ANDERSON - DIRECT 1 Well, the — well, the palm fronds are there. the building was secure, took out the trash. 2 Do you see any cups? 2 Q As of Friday night when you threw trash away, did 3 A There may be one on top of the cardboard. you see anybody in the dumpster area? 3 Q That's ---4 4 A No. 5 A Oh, yeah, 5 Q Okay, The trash you just saw in the photographs, 6 Q I'll just move it up. was it in the dumpster, what you saw in the photograph, was 7 A Okay, Yeah, there's — 7 it in the dumpster in the photo or was it on the ground in the There's one on the cardboard and photo? 8 9 Another one down to the -- to the left corner, A 9 A There was trash in the dumpster, as well as on the 10 It's trash? 0 10 ground. 11 A Yeah, it's trash. 11 Q Okay. When you threw trash away into that 12 Q Okay, And the plastic bags here, the clear plastic 12 dumpster, do you recall whether or not there was trash out on 13 bags, do you see -- do you see at the — on the right hand of the ground or was it all in the dumpster? 14 the corner of the photo there or the right side of the photo? 14 A There was some on the ground. 15 15 Q Okay, So it would have been both places? 16 0 Does that also appear to be plastic bags? 16 A Yes. 17 A 17 Q Okay. The photo that we showed you where you Was that consistent with what you knew that was 18 kind of described, well, Exhibit Number 6 you were talking 19 thrown -- used to throw garbage away to -- into that garbage? about, you know, what you saw there. When you deposited 20 trash on Friday night in that dumpster, do you recall whether 21 Okay. And Proposed Exhibit Number 7 shows a or not the extent of the trash like this was outside the 21 closeup of, actually, the bags in that. Is that -- is that right? 22 dumpster? 22 23 A 23 A I know there was trash behind the dumpster and to 24 Now, did you -- did you ever come to know an 24 the side of it. I'm not -- I couldn't be sure how much. IV-87

. LOBATO 9114/06

IDERSON - DIRECT ANDERSON - DIRECT Okay. Do you recall whether or not the dumpster 1 THE COURT: You may was full? 2 BY MR, KEPHART: 3 I believe it was reasonably full. Α 3 Q just show you it this way You want to just look And I'm showing you Exhibit Number 4, Can you see 4 4 through those real quick? 5 this photo here? 5 (Pause in the proceedings) 6 A Yes. 6 A Okay, 7 You can actually see the top of the dumpster, is that 7 Q And in regards to Exhibit Number 4 that you've been 8 correct? 8 -- we've been beating it to death here, they appear different, 9 Α Yes. 9 do they not, the photographs that you -- the photogr'aphs you 10 Q And you -- can you see any trash inside the dumpster 10 have there with regards to these photographs? 11 there? 11 A These ones are probably daily. 12 12 A No. You recall them being taken at a later period of time Okay. When you threw trash away on the Friday 13 13 versus the photographs here, the photograph that's on this? night, though, you said you believed that it was reasonably 14 There's no trash in that one? full. 15 15 A Yeah, 16 A It was --16 Q The dumpster has been moved? 17 Q But --17 A Yeah, the dumpster was moved, It was generally full because of both businesses. MR, KEPHART: Okay. Your Honor, I'll move to 18 18 19 Okay, S6 on Friday night, do you believe that the 19 admit Exhibits, I think it is, 117 through 120, 20 garbage had come to the point where you could see it above 20 THE COURT: Not 116? the top of the dumpster? 21 21 MR. KEPHART: Oh, I'm sorry, Yeah, 116 through 22 A I believe so. 22 120. Thanks, Judge. 23 And what is, Exhibit Number 117, what is — what is 23 MR. SCHIECK: No objection, Your Honor. this here to the -- to the left? 24 THE COURT: Granted, IV-90 IV-92 ANDERSON - DIRECT ANDERSON - CROSS A It's covered parking, 1 (State's Exhibit Nos, 116 thru 120 admitted) Covered parking? 2 MR, KEPHART: Pass the witness, Your Honor, 3 Α 3 Thank you, 4 Q And what's covering the trash enclosure area? **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 5 A Just looked like a fence. They used the chainlink BY MS. ZALKIN: 5 fence just to cover the top of it. 6 Q Good afternoon, Mr. Anderson. Do you recall during 6 7 0 Could you see through it? 7 the relevant time period what days the garbage was picked 8 8 up? A Yes. 9 So if you were standing inside where the dumpster is 9 A Not to my recollection, in this photograph and you looked up out of there, could you 10 10 MS. ZALKIN: And just so we could be clear with 11 see the parking structure next to it? respect to the dates, could we mark this as the next exhibit in 11 12 A Yes. 12 order for the defense, please? And this -- I'm just showing it 13 Okay. Do you recall on Friday night whether or not 13 to counsel. This is just a printout of a calendar for July, 2001. Q the actual enclosure was locked? 14 14 MR, KEPHART: Oh, okay. Okay. Yeah, okay. It -- after the lock was broken off, it was never 15 15 That's fine, 16 locked. 16 (Pause in the proceedings) MR, KEPHART: The Court's indulgence, Your Honor, THE CLERK: It's II. 17 17 18 (Pause in the proceedings) 18 MS, ZALKIN: II. Thank you. BY MR. KEPHART: 19 THE COURT: It's been marked as Defendant's 19 Okay. Just one more thing. With respect to Exhibit Proposed IL 20 20 116, 117, 118, 119 and 120, which I had shown you. Do you MS. ZALKIN: Yes. Thank you, Your Honor. □ 21 21 22 want me to show you again? 22 (Pause in the proceedings) 23 MR. KEPHART: May I approach the witness, Your 23 MS. ZALKIN: Thank you, 24 24 Honor? IV-93 11/-91

22

23

Honor?

24 ||/

(Pause in the proceedings)

IV-97

22

23

The exact date, I can't remember.

IV-95

Sure. June of 2001?

Yes, ma'am.

N v. LOBATO 9/14/06

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

ANDERSON - REDIRECT,)ERSON - REDIRECT BY MR, KEPHART: THE COURT: 137? I thought it was 136. Q While she's marking those, I'm gonna ask you if you 2 SCHIECK: I thought so. It is 137, Your Honor. can identify what 136 shows, Does that look familiar to you? 3 THE COURT: Okay, So it's 137 that -- that was A It looks like the view of the dumpster, possibly, from 4 placed before the witness, 5 the street, MR, KEPHART: Okay. 6 6 Q Would it be from Flamingo or from Wynn? THE COURT: Any objection? A Flamingo 7 MR. SCHIECK: No, No objection, Your Honor, Q Okay, That looks like from Flamingo? (State's Exhibit No, 137 admitted) 8 A Off of Wynn. 9 BY MR. KEPHART: Q Okay, So it's looking east to west? 10 Q And I want to -- I want to show you what's marked A Yes, 11 as State's Proposed Exhibit 139 and ask you to look at 137 and Q And you have the dumpster in the background? 12 139 together, tell me if you can recognize if they're the same A Yes, 13 area, Q Okay. Can you see this area on the -- on 121, 14 A I believe so, Exhibit 121? 15 O Okay, And 139 is taken from the west to the east, as A I think it's probably about right here somewhere, 16 if you're standing near the dumpster. Would that be correct? COURT RECORDER: I'm not picking that up, Sorry. 17 A Yes, BY MR. KEPHART: 18 MR, KEPHART: Move to admit State's Exhibit 139, Q Probably around where? 19 MR, SCHIECK: No objection, Your Honor. A Oh, Right here, THE COURT: Granted. 20 Q Okay. Does it have in the photograph like the 21 (State's Exhibit No. 139 admitted) planter area surrounded by a curb? 22 BY MR. KEPHART: THE COURT: He said probably about right here 23 Q This is the parking lot area just around the back by when he pointed to -24 the dumpster, is that correct? IV-98 IV-100 ANDERSON - REDIRECT ANDERSON - REDIRECT MR. KEPHART: I'll get to that, Judge, when — 1 A Yes. THE COURT: The problem he's got his back to the 2 Okay, Is this -- is that a corner in the parking lot as 3 well? microphone MR KEPHART: Oh, okay. 4 A Yes. THE COURT: And so she was drawing your 5 So you would have to go around the end of that attention to the fact that she's not picking him up. planter area, is that right? 6 MR. KEPHART: Okay, Thank you, Judge, 7 A Yes. 8 BY MR. KEPHART: Q Exhibit 137, is this -- it's kind of dark. Is this one — 9 Q Okay. On 121 you pointed in what area? 9 is this the planter area that we're talking about, and that's A Here, There was a -- the curb and there was a 10 planter area right there. A Yes. sir. 11 So would you agree it's just east of the dumpster 12 Q Okay. area? 13 A Yes, sir, A Yes Q What is this right at the bottom? Can you tell, from 14 And it's in a curb and planter area? 15 this photo, can you tell what this is right here where my fingers are? A Yes. 16 And then that's what is shown in Proposed Exhibit 17 A Looks like tire tracks. 137? 18 Q Okay. There's multiple tire tracks there, is that A I believe so. correct? 19 Q Okay, This is taken at night? 20 A Yes. A Yes, 21 Q And along the curb itself, can you see where it Q Does that accurately depict that you recall that area? appears there's tire scuffs as well? 22 A Yes. 23 A Yes 24 24 MR KEPHART: Okay, Move to admit 137. Q And then up here there's a tire track? IV-99 IV-101

ANDERSON - REDIRECT()ERSON - REDIRECT 1 Yeah, 1 Q Okay, You never saw anybody do that? 2 2 And then there's this one here as well? 3 3 Q Do you see here at the end of the curb, does it Α appear that people cut this curb short there? Q Okay, And that — and do all these tire tracks seem 4 4 to track this -5 5 A Yeah. 6 6 THE COURT: Now you've said this one here as well, Q Okay. Do you have any independent recollection of 7 MR. KEPHART: Oh, I'm sorry, I'm sorry, Judge. 7 the night on the Friday that you were there whether or not you 8 THE COURT: And you've switched to -- you said saw the -- saw tire tracks in that area? 9 9 this. A I don't recall, sir. 10 10 Q Okay. Nothing that raised your attention or anything MR. KEPHART: 137, THE COURT: Thank you 11 like that? 11 BY MR. KEPHART: 12 A Nothing out of the ordinary, no. 12 On 137, I said this one here and I'm pointing to the Q Okay. What -- is this something out of the ordinary 13 13 photo and there's a tire track there as well? 14 you think that would raise your attention? A Yes. 15 A Um, 15 Do all these tire tracks seem to track around that, the Q No? Yes. no? 16 16 A Some -- not really. Some of the ones that were a corner there? 17 17 18 A Yes, sir, 18 little thicker maybe, where somebody had laid down some Q Okay, And, as a matter of fact, in 139 that's the end 19 rubber, but -19 of this planter, is that correct? 20 Q Okay. Would you have done anything with that as a 20 security guard or anything? 21 21 22 And what is this right here where I'm pointing in the 22 A No. middle of the -- can you tell? 23 MR. KEPHART: Okay. Pass the witness, Your 23 Α Gravel. 24 Honor, 24 IV-102 IV-104 ANDERSON - REDIRECT ANDERSON - RECROSS Q It's all gravel. Is it darker in part of that area? THE COURT: Recross, MS. ZALKIN: Yes. Thank you, Your Honor. 2 **RECROSS EXAMINATION** 3 And what's up here where I'm pointing now? 3 A That --BY MS. ZALKIN: Q Can you see that? 5 Q Mr. Anderson, were you aware of any crimes that 5 were occurring in the vicinity that you were responsible for? A That would be a bush. 6 6 7 Okay. Do you recall whether or not there was a bush 7 A We were aware of some but nothing in particular. here where it'd be -- this darker area? Do you remember? 8 Q Can you elaborate to the best of your ability what Not to my recollection at this time. 9 9 crimes were brought to your attention? 10 A We were aware of some robberies in the area that — Do you -- do you know whether or not one was ever 10 removed from there? 11 Q Robberies of residences? 11 12 Α No 12 A No, there had been some at the local bar, some at 13 that place, 13 Q Okay, THE COURT: Is that no — 14 Q And were there any measures taken to try to guard against such occurrences? 15 THE WITNESS: No, I --15 16 MR. KEPHART: Your Honor, I'm gonna object as to THE COURT: -- one was never removed or, no, I 16 foundation, what day is she talking about, when was he don't know? 17 17 THE WITNESS: I don't recollect, I don't recollect. aware, when he --- you know. I mean, I don't ---18 18 19 THE COURT: Sustained, THE COURT: Thank you. 19 BY MR, KEPHART: 20 BY MS. ZALKIN: 20 Q Okay, Do you know of any individuals that ever cut 21 Q In June of 2001, were there any steps taken to try to 21 22 or did you ever see anybody cut the curb a little short and go 22 mitigate against any crime in the area? right across that curb there? 23 A Not as far as we were concerned. 23 A I don't recall. 24 Q And the same question for July of 2001, 24 IV-103 IV-105

21

TESTA-DIRECT Not as far as we were concerned. 1 MS. DiGIACOMO: I just don't want to get confused MS. ZALKIN: May I approach, Your Honor? I have 2 on what's been admitted. Thank you, 3 a quick question about the aerial, 3 **DIRECT EXAMINATION** 4 THE COURT: All right, 4 BY MS,, DiGIACOMO: 5 BY MS, ZALKIN: 5 Q Would you please state your occupation and 6 Q Drawing your attention again to State's Proposed 6 assignment? Exhibit 121, this -- the top of this blowup, those appear to be 7 A I'm a field training officer at Southwest Area 8 apartment buildings? 8 Command at this time 9 A Yes, ma'am. 9 Q How long have you been with Metro overall? 10 And those are the Grandview Apartments? 10 A A little over seven and a half years now, 11 A I don't recall the name. 11 Q I want to direct your attention back to July 1', 2 --12 Does the address 48255 West Viking sound accurate excuse me, July 8th of 2001. Were you still employed and 12 13 to you? 13 working? 14 I don't even recall the address there. 14 A Yes. 15 MS. ZALKIN: The Court's indulgence. 15 Q What shift were you working at that time? 16 THE COURT: Yes. 16 A I was working graveyard shift at Southwest Area 17 (Pause in the proceedings) 17 Commandr 18 MS, ZALKIN: Thank you. Nothing further. 18 Q So graveyard shift. What time would you have come 19 THE COURT: Redirect. 19 on on July 8th? 20 MR, KEPHART: We have nothing further, Your 20 A We start briefing at 10:00 o'clock p.m. and we get 21 Honor, Thank you. 21 done at 8:00 o'clock a.m. 22 Thank you, Mr, Anderson. Q So you would have started the night of July 8th and 22 23 THE COURT: You may step down, finished the morning of July 9th? 23 24 THE WITNESS: Thank you, 24 A Yes. ma'am. IV: 106 IV-108 TESTA - DIRECT THE COURT: I'm gonna ask that counsel please 1 Q Now when you -- after you finish briefing, what do approach. 2 you do then? 3 (Off-record bench conference at 16:09:47 until 16:15:39) 3 A At that point in time we go ahead and log on to our 4 THE COURT: The Court is marking a calendar for 4 car, into the service, and then we begin patrolling the area or the year 2001 as Court's exhibit next in number. 5 handling calls for service. 6 THE CLERK: 6. 6 Q When you got into your car that night, was there any 7 THE COURT: Which will be 6. 7 call that you were dispatched to? 8 (Off-record bench conference at 16:15:56 until 16:16:57) 8 A Shortly after logging on, I got dispatched to a sick or 9 MS, DiGIACOMO: Your Honor, the State calls James 9 injured person call near the area of Flamingo and Arville. 10 Testa. 10 Q Do you recall what time that was? 11 THE COURT: Very well. 11 A Approximately 10:45 p.m. 12 THE CLERK: Please come all the way forwardr 12 Q And what did you do when you got that call? 13 Remain standing and raise your right hand, 13 A I responded to the area to meet up with the person 14 JAMES TESTA, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN 14 who was reporting the call at the Chevron station on the 15 THE CLERK: Thank your Please be seated. State 15 corner of Flamingo and Arville, 16 your name and spell it for the record, please, 16 Q Then what happened? 17 THE WITNESS: James Testa, T-E-S-T-A. 17 A I made contact with the P.R. and asked him what 18 THE COURT: The State may proceed. was going on. He stated that there was a subject who was in 19 MS, DiGIACOMO: Thank you, Your Honor. 19 a dumpster around the corner, on the same side of the street, 20 May I approach? 20 and he didn't know if he was back there, he was injured, sick THE COURT: Yes. 21 or dead, or what. 22 MS. DiGIACOMO: I'm just gonna — if I may 22 THE COURT: Would you please tell the jury what 23 approach the witness, 23 PR. stands for? 24 THE COURT: Yes, 24 THE WITNESS: Oh, P.R. stands for person IV-107 IV-109

<u>v LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TESTA - DIRECT

reporting

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

IS

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

car?

BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Thank you And how long did it take you to get from the station when you left to this call?

A Three, four minutes, roughly.

Q I'm gonna show you what's sitting right behind you This is State's Exhibit 121. Do you recognize that?

A Yes, ma'am,

Q And how do you recognize that?

A That is part of the area which I patrol and the area in which the call came out on that night,

MS. DiGIACOMO: Your Honor, if I put it here, can you still hear? Okay,

THE COURT: Yes.

BY MS, DiGIACOMO:

Q On State's Exhibit 121, can you see the Chevron station you were referring to at Arville and West Flamingo?

A No, ma'am,,,

Q Okay, Can you see the area that you responded to?

A It is still just a little bit off of the side of the picture, ma'am.

All right. So after you made contact with the person reporting, where did you go?

A We then walked -- or we took our patrol vehicles over

IV-110

TESTA - DIRECT

to the bank area in which he stated the subject was behind in a dumpster area,

Q Okay. You're saying we. Did you respond with another officer?

A Yes Myself and Officer Chavez,

Q Were you in separate cars?

A Yes, ma'am,

Q And when you were working on that date, were you dressed as you are in the courtroom today?

A Yes.

Were you also in a marked black-and-white patrol

A Yes, ma'am

Q Do you recall the name of the person that reported?

A I believe his first name was Richard but I do not remember what his last name was at all.

Q Is it on the map, the location of the dumpster you went to?

A Yes, ma'am.

Would you please point it out for the jury?

A It would be approximately right about here,

Okay. And is that in a parking lot?

A Yes, ma'am.

And do you know what parking lot it was?

IV-111

TESTA DIRECT

A It was the Nevada State Bank that's still there now, ma'am.

Q Now, what happened to the person who reported, Richard?

A We had him stay outside of the crime scene and keep the distance away from us, That way, in case there was any type of ambush or anything like that or if there was a crime scene, he would not be inside the crime scene destroying any more of the possible evidence that would be inside,

Q Okay, And you hadn't — you didn't know anything other than somebody possibly behind the dumpster at this time?

A Correct, ma'am,

Q You can go ahead and sit down. Thank you,

Now when you arrived, what did the area look like?

A It was an empty parking lot. It was very low-lit. There wasn't much light,, And the dumpster area was -- the two doors to the dumpster area was closed.

Q Can you describe what the dumpster area looked like?

A The dumpster area was basically a type of a square, On the three sides were brick cement that enclosed it and the front would have been two large doors,

Q All right, And you -- is the two doors you're referring

IV-112

TESTA - DIRECT

to when you got there?

A Yes,

Q Okay. And you said they were partially open?

A They were partially open, closed up. I'm not sure exactly if they're locked in place. I can't remember at this time.

Q All right, But could you see through into the dumpster?

A No, ma'am.

Q All right. So what did you do?

A At that time, I had opened up the dumpster area, the two doors, to open it fully wide to see if we could see inside the dumpster area.

Q Now you said it wasn't that well-lit in the area,

A No

Q Were you able to see very well into the dumpster?

A What we did is or, actually, what I did is I pulled my patrol car right in front of it, faced it towards the dumpster area, turning on my headlights and my side spotlights to help lighten up the area so I could see better,

Q Okay. And then at that time after you — well, did you do that before or after you --

A Before I approached.

Q Okay, And then what did you do after you

<u>LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

approached?

approached?

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

A Once we approached, I opened up the doors, at which time the dumpster was in full length open -- or, I'm sorry, closed as well of the area to where you could not see around the back side of the dumpster.

TESTA - DIRECT

Q Okay, Now I'm gonna show you what's been marked and admitted as State's Exhibit Number 4 or -- wrong exhibit There's a screen in front of you Okay. Can you see State's Exhibit Number 4 on your screen?

A Yes.

Q Amazing. Does this look familiar to you?

A Yes, it does.

Q Okay, What is this?

A This is the crime scene area,

Q Okay, And is this the way it looked when you first arrived?

A No, ma'am.

Q Okay. How did it look when you first arrived?

A When I first arrived both the doors were closed and the dumpster was not sideways like that. It was facing the opposite direction where each side would be south and north, covering the whole front of the -- of the dumpster area so you could not see behind it.

Q Okay, So when you first opened the door, the

IV-114

TESTA - DIRECT

dumpster was in front of you?

A Correct,

Q You're not looking at the side of it as in State's Exhibit Number 4?

A Correct.

Q How did it get to this position?

A In order to see behind it, to see what was behind it, at that time I had to use my baton on the side openings of the dumpster and tried to wheel it off to the side just so that we had more of a clearance, we were able to get back there and see back there without putting ourselves in danger.

Q Okay. Now, did both you and Officer Chavez go into the dumpster area?

A I went inside and I believe Officer Chavez stayed outside of it,

Q When the dumpster, before you had moved it, could you get by on either side?

A It was very thin, that I can remember, to get through it and to be able to try to squeeze myself through it with all the equipment that I was wearing would have been very difficult and it would have put us, what we call, a fatal funnel, which if there was ambush back there it would have been a very dangerous situation to be -- for us to be in.

Q Okay. So for officer safety pretty much is why you

TESTA - DIRECT

had to move that dumpster?

A Yes, ma'am,

Q What happened when you moved the dumpster?

A I moved the dumpster and I could immediately see several blood spots on the ground.

MS. DiGIACOMO: Now, Your Honor, may I approach?

THE COURT: Yes,

BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Okay. I'm gonna show you what's been marked as State's Proposed Exhibits 2, 3, 5 and 7 through 37. Can you just flip through these and let me know if you recognize them?

(Pause in the proceedings)

A Yes, ma'am, I recognize it.

Q Okay. Are these all photographs of the scene from that night, on July $8^{\,\text{th}}$, 2001?

A Yes, ma'am.

Q Do they fairly and accurately depict the scene that you saw at the trash dumpster that night?

A Yes, ma'am,

MS. DIGIACOMO: Your Honor, at this time the State would move for admission of State's Proposed Exhibits 2, 3, 5, and 7 through 37.

MR. SCHIECK: No objection, Your Honor.

IV-116

TESTA - DIRECT

THE COURT: Granted.

(State's Exhibit Nos. 2, 3, 5, and 7 thru 37 admitted) BY MS, DiGIACOMO:

Q Now you -- I'm sorry, You stated when you first went into the dumpster you noticed some blood?

A Yes, ma'am,

Q What specifically did you notice?

A There were a couple of splattered-looking blood spots on the ground and some shoe prints.

Q Did you notice anything else at that time?

A As I approached in further, being very careful where I stepped, I noticed a pair of sandals that were sitting up on the side that were next to each other. And as I looked around, underneath a bunch of garbage I could see what appeared to be a foot sticking out,

Q All right, And what did you do at that point?

A At that time, I made several attempts and calls out very loudly to see if I'd get the individual to answer me, if he happened to be asleep or injured or anything of that effect.

Q And what did you yell out?

A I yelled out that police officer, are you all right, are you okay, wake up, several times.

Q Now you said all you could see was a foot. What --

A At that time, yes.

IV-117

J∨ <u>v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

0

1

2

3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TESTA - DIRECT

Q What else did you see around the foot?

A Around the foot it looked like the pants may be down a little bit, there was more blood, and there was a lot of looked like miscellaneous trash on top of the rest of the person.

Q So at this point, what did you do? Well, strike that. Did the person respond that you were yelling out to?

A No

5

6

8

Ç

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

Q What did you do at that point?

A At that time, I asked for medical to be en route,

Q So you, over your radio, called for medical?

A That I can remember, yes, ma'am.

Q And what happened? Did medical arrive?

A An AMR unit and a fire department unit arrived.

Q How long did it take?

A A few minutes. 1 couldn't tell you for sure.

Q What happened when they arrived?

A When they arrived, I had one of the -- I believe it was the fire department, just one of the gentlemen, come into the crime scene, telling him to be extremely careful where he stepped, light up the areas so that he did not step in any of the blood or try to contaminate any of the scene, to attempt to check on the welfare of the subject,

Q Did you see -- could you see what he was doing? A Yes.

IV-118

TESTA - DIRECT

Q What did he do?

A He stepped in, went over towards the front of the cardboard box that was over the top of the -- of the subject. He lifted the cardboard box approximately 6, 8 inches up to look underneath, and at that time he lowered the box, came back out and told me that he would be dead,

Q Okay. What did you do at that point?

A At that time, I moved everybody out, myself and Officer Chavez would have started to put up crime scene tape to keep everybody out that didn't need to be in there and started making notifications to our supervisor and detectives,

Q What do you mean your supervisors and detectives?

A Oh, we would notify our supervisor, our sergeant, of what we had and then we would notify our violent crimes detectives or general assignment detectives, in turn, which homicide would also be notified.

Q All right. So a situation with a body behind a dumpster is not something you would handle as patrol?

A No.

Okay. After you did that, did the other detectives arrive?

A They started arriving, yes.

Q All right. What did you do?

A At that time, I kept my distance outside and made

TESTA DIRECT

sure that we had recontacted the person reporting and that he stood by 'cause the detectives would more than likely want to talk to him and basically tried to keep everybody at the scene until the detectives responded and I,D. -- or the crime scene analysts personnel responded to start processing the scene.

Q Were you -- so you didn't just leave when people, other people, started to arrive?

A No, ma'am. I stayed there the entire shift.

Q Okay. So what time did you leave?

A A little after 7:00 a.m.

Q On July 9th?

A Correct.

MS. DiGIACOMO: Okay. May I approach, Your

Honor?

THE COURT: Yes.

BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Officer, I'm gonna show you what's been marked for identification as State's Proposed Exhibits 142, 143 and 144. Would you look at those and let me know if you recognize them?

A Yes, The first two are the -- is the camera that the crime scene analysts would have brought in with them to take their pictures, and the last one is the pictures of the foot prints that we found that were in blood when I first arrived,

IV-120

TESTA - DIRECT

Q And so these fairly and accurately depict what you saw that night at the dumpster on July 8th, 2001?

A Yes.

MS, DiGIACOMO: Your Honor, at this time the State would move for admission of State's Proposed Exhibits 142, 143 and 144.

MR, SCHIECK: No objection,,

THE COURT: Granted.

(State's Exhibit Nos, 142, 143 and 144 admitted) BY MS, DIGIACOMO:

Q Now I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 144. Do you see that?

A Yes, ma'am.

Q Okay. Can you describe for the jury what's depicted here? And if you actually touch the screen in front of you, it'll make a line.

A Okay. In between here and here and these areas were the separate blood splats that we had seen. And from this area here, along here and back through this area would be the foot prints that I saw.

Q And what's located in the back of this photograph?

A The back of the photograph would be the garbage and over here somewhere would be, roughly, the -- I believe the -- or the subject was back there, roughly.

IV-121

V LOBATO 9/14/06

2

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

2 12.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TESTA -

Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit Number 2, Do you recognize what's depicted here?

A Yes, sir,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Q What's depicted there?

A That would be my patrol vehicle and it was facing the dumpster area in which we opened, and the patrol vehicle lights would be on lighting up that area, and that would be some of the detectives and the crime scene analysts

Q Now, is your car in the same spot it was at this — during this photograph as it was when you first arrived and you said you put on your lights?

A Yes, sir,

Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit Number 6. What's depicted here?

A What is here is when I walked in the back, I could see the foot on the upper right side which was sticking out, and to include the garbage that was covering the body of the person.

Q Now, can you point to where the foot is that you're referring to?

A Roughly, the foot is right there and that's what it looked -- at that time.

Q Okay. So is this the way it looked when you first saw the body?

IV-122

TESTA - DIRECT

A Yes.

Q Now you said that the medical personnel that arrived went in there and lifted a cardboard box approximately 6 to 8 inches?

A Yes,

Q Do you see the box that you saw them lift here?

A Yes, I do,

Q Where is that?

A It is tip main cardboard box right there,

Q Okay. And which end of that cardboard box was lifted up?

A He would have lifted roughly right around here near the head area,

Q Now, were you there -- excuse me. While you were there, could you see what the technicians were doing inside the dumpster area?

A At a point, I tried to keep myself outside so that I did not step inside to contaminate the scene.

Q Okay So do you -- do you know whether or not the trash was ever removed?

A The trash was slowly removed piece-by-piece by the crime scene analysis person,

Q Did you see anything unusual as they were taking out the trash?

TESTA - DIRECT

A As they were taking out the trash, you could begin to see parts of the body where the subject's pants were removed down towards his ankle area, his genital region appeared to be missing, cut off, and his face and upper body areas appeared to be swollen up and blood-covered.

Q Okay. Now I'm showing you State's Exhibit Number 16, What's depicted there?

A That would be the upper portion of the subject where' his face, again, to me appeared to be swollen and it is blood-covered up on his shirt and his face area,

MS. DiGIACOMO: The Court's indulgence,

THE COURT: Was that 116?

MS, DiGIACOMO: That was -- thank you, Your

Honor, That was 16.

THE COURT: I don't think 16 has been admitted MS. DiGIACOMO: We just admitted 7 through 37.

THE COURT: Yes, Thank you,

MS. DIGIACOMO: Okay.

19 BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Now I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit Number 12-What's depicted here?

A That would be the lower portion of the subject where his pants are down and his genital area missing.

MR. !KEPHART: What number is that?

IV-124

TESTA - CROSS

MS. DiGIACOMO: That was State's Exhibit Number

BY MS_DiGIACOMO:

Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit Number 28. What's depicted here?

A I believe that would be his genital area that was cut off.

And can you point in there 'cause it's kind of dark? A Right along here.

Did you see any other things unusual from the body after the trash was taken out?

A I believe that there were also teeth found in the area, but I can't remember exactly for sure,

MS, DiGIACOMO: Okay. Pass the witness.

THE COURT: Cross.

MR. SCHIECK: Thank you, Your Honor.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. SCHIECK:

Q Officer Testa, as of 2001, how long had you been a police officer'?

A A little over seven and a half years now, sir,

Q Now. So back then you'd been a couple of years?

A Two and a half, three years, roughly, sir.

Q And now you're a training officer?

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2

3

5

6 7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TESTA - CROSS TESTA - CROSS Yes, sir, 1 A Yes. sir. Which means you teach other officers how to do the 2 Q Okay. At this point in time, had you determined job of a patrol officer? 3 whether there was or was not a body behind the dumpster? A Yes, sir. 4 A No, sir. We could not see. Q And included in that training would be teaching those Q Did you attempt to go around the sides and look over officers how to preserve crime scenes that you come upon? the top to see if you could see anything back there? 6 A Yes, sir. 7 A I was not able to do it. I can't, I'm pretty short, Q That's an important component of your job as a 8 couldn't see the high anyway, sir. patrol officer, is to preserve crime scenes that you come 9 Q Okay So you determined it would be necessary to across, correct? move the dumpster at that point in time? 10 A Yes, sir. 11 A Yes, sir. And you were trained in that before you became a 12 Q Even though you're taught not to move things at a patrol officer? 13 crime scene, sometimes you just have to in order to see what 14 you're looking for, correct? A Yes, sir. And you must be doing it pretty good. They made A Yes, sir, 15 you a training officer to teach others, correct? Q So there was nothing out of your normal procedure 16 A Yes, sir, that you would have to slightly move that dumpster to gain 17 Okay. And, when you got this call and talked to 18 access to the back? Richard, and he indicated there was a body behind the 19 A No, sir. dumpster? 20 Q Okay. And you were very careful and used your baton so as not to leave behind any fingerprints on the A Yes, sir 21 Q That was sufficient enough information that you felt 22 dumpster? it necessary to pull your vehicle up and turn on all your lights 23 A Correct, sir, to light the area before you even approached the area where Q So that later someone could come along and perhaps 24 IV-126 IV-128 TESTA - CROSS **TESTA - CROSS** the body might be? dust for prints and determine if someone else had touched the A Yes, sir, 2 dumpster? Q And you wanted to do that so you had sufficient light 3 A Yes, sir. to make sure you didn't disturb, if indeed this was a crime Q Now you said you swung the dumpster. Were you 4 scene, disturb anything? able to manipulate it within the confines of the enclosure or 5 A Correct, sir, 6 did you have to pull it out in order to turn it a little bit? And also for officer safety? A I just used the one side, sir, of the dumpster and 0 7 basically just swung it open so where the back side basically Officer safety, Yes, sir, 8 And when you approached, first approached, the 9 would have pivoted on it. dumpster after you pulled your car up, the doors were shut, Q Okay. So you were able to rotate it so that you could 10 the gate were shut? get by? 11 Yes, sir. 12 A Yes, sir,, Q And you were the only officer that went back into the Were they completely shut so that they touched or 13 back at that point in time? were they gapped a little or do you recall? 14 I honestly don't remember completely for sure, sir. 15 A Yes, sir, But you were able to open those, the swinging 16 Q Officer Chavez did not go with you? A No, sir. He was standing just on the outside, sir. doors? 17 Outwards, Yes, sir. 18 Q And once you were back there, you were able to see Okay. Was there one door or two? blood and what you perceived to be a human foot? 19 I can remember there were two doors, sir. 20 A Yes, sir. So you swung the doors open. And now you're 21 Q You didn't touch the body in any way at that point? confronted with this large green dumpster? 22 A No, sir. 23 Q You called out loudly to the -- to the individual, Yes, sir. And it's a little tight on both ends for you to slide by? hoping to get a response and got none? 24

\11/<u>v. LOBATO</u> 9/14/06

2

3

6

7

a 9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

2

3

4

5

6 7

a

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TESTA - CROSS TESTA - CROSS A Correct, sir, A Yes, sir. 1 2 Q At that point in time you hadn't done anything to Q When medical, the fire department and AMR arrived, determine whether or not the person was deceased but, 3 did they pull into the parking area also? clearly, he was not responding? 4 A They pulled in the parking area but we kept them a 5 A Correct, sir, distance away from the scene, sir. Q And so at that point the correct thing to do was call 6 Q Now we've got State's Exhibit 2, which shows your 7 patrol car and what appears to be probably the detectives and for medical? A Yes, sir. 8 crime scene analysts? Q Which you did? 9 A Yes, sir. A Yes, sir. 10 Q Okay, Where did the fire department pull up when --Q And both AMR and the fire department responded? and AMR pull up when they got there? Is it depicted on there? 11 A That I can remember, yes, sir. 12 A They would have been roughly back around here You had to wait a few minutes for them to get there? 13 somewhere, sir. We tried -- I tried to keep them back farther Α 14 away from the scene so that they didn't have to travel in and And I would assume that you stayed right there at 15 out. 0 the dumpster and made sure nobody got back there until 16 Q So you were controlling pretty much the whole medical arrived? 17 parking lot at that point in time? Yes, sir, 18 A Yes, sir. Q Okay. And would it be fair to say no one went back 19 Q And stopped them before they could come any there? 20 further? A Yes, sir, A No, sir. 21 Q Okay. You didn't leave for any period of time so 22 Q And that's because there could have been evidence someone could have got back there -23 or things to be collected within the parking lot area itself, such A No, sir. 24 as tire -1V-130 1V-132□ TESTA - CROSS **TESTA - CROSS** Q -- and disturbed things? And when you went back A Possibly, yes, sir. and called out to the individual, you were careful not to step in 2 Q Such as tire tracks, things of that nature? any blood? 3 A Yes. sir. 4 Q Where was Officer Chavez's car? A Correct, sir, 5 A I believe, if I can remember correctly, he parked back Because you don't want to leave your foot prints behind? 6 over in this area, sir, 7 Q Okay. Behind your car sort of? Correct, sir, 8 But you were able to see there were other foot prints A Behind my car. The parking lot squared around the Q 9 building so that you can approach from two different sides -there? A Yes, sir 10 Q Okay, That appeared to have been made in blood? A -- of that area. Q 11 12 Q And so the medical personnel exited their vehicles A So you worked your way around so you wouldn't 13 and approached the dumpster area? touch anything to leave any evidence of your being there and A Only one, sir. I had only one come in. 14 then backed out just as carefully? 15 Q Okay. And that was from the fire department? 16 A Yes, sir, A Yes, sir. Q And stood watch, along with Officer Chavez, until 17 Q But AMR, the ambulance company, was on scene? medical arrived? 18 A That I can remember, yes, sir. A Yes, sir. 19 Q But you didn't ask them to come back? Were there any people accumulated in the area as a 20 A No, sir, just one at that time. result of your presence? 21 Q At that point in time, did you have a pretty good idea A At that time, no, sir. 22 that the individual was probably deceased? Mr, Shaft was there but you had stationed him some 23 A Possibly, yes, sir. distance away and said just hold right here? 24 Q An so you had one individual from the fire

1V-131

Vv LOBATO 9/14/06

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10 or

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

department come back. Do you recall who that was?

A No, sir, I do not

Q Do you recall what station he responded from?

TESTA - CROSS

A I don't remember if it's 15, 21, 22, I'm not exactly sure which one there, sir.

Q And did you follow him up to the dumpster area?

A Yes, sir.

Q Did you give him any instructions as you were approaching the dumpster area?

A Yes, sir,

Q An what did you tell him?

A I told him be extremely careful where he steps, watch where he steps, make sure he doesn't step in any of the blood or anything like that, just do the bare minimum that you would need to do to check on the subject's welfare.

Q And did he acknowledge that he understood those directions?

A Yes, sir,

Q Is it fair to say that the Clark County Fire Department trains their fire officers not to disturb crime scenes also?

A I do not know for sure, sir, but I think so,

Q Did you watch as he entered into the dumpster area?

A Yes, sir,

Q You indicated that he touched the cardboard and

1V-134

TESTA - CROSS

the crime scene tape put when you marked off the area?

A There would have been two major areas of the crime scene tape we put up, sir. One would have been off in this direction, over here, and that would be that way no individuals could drive that way or come up that way, and it would have been further down south from that area towards the end of the building to keep yourself a larger crime scene and keep everybody out of that area.

Q So you basically roped off the whole parking lot area

A Pretty much, sir, Yes, sir,

Q Now behind in this photograph, looking past where the individuals were positioned, what is beyond? Is there a wall back there?

A Yes, sir

Q And what's over the wall, do you know?

A It is an apartment complex.

Q Were steps taken to make sure nobody came over the wall from the apartment complex and got into that crime scene area?

A Standing there, sir, basically making sure that nobody did climb over there. Yes, sir.

Q Okay, And you indicated that once you had the pronouncement of a dead body that you started making phone

IV-136

TESTA - CROSS

lifted it approximately 6 to 8 inches?

A Yes, sir,

Q Besides that, did he touch anything else in that area?

A No, sir,

Q He didn't touch the dumpster?

A No, sir.

Q And he had on his rubber gloves, I assume?

A Yes, sir.

Q And he pronounced death based on being able to look upon lifting the cardboard?

A Yes. sir.

Q He did not touch the body at any point in time?

A No, sir

Q And you watched to make sure he didn't step and leave his foot prints behind?

A Correct, sir,

Q Okay. And I assume he did not?

A Correct. He did not, sir.

Q At that point in time you knew you had a dead body and, therefore, had probably a homicide scene and took action to tape the scene off, is that correct?

A Yes, sir

21

22

23

24

Q Now in photograph Number 2 that we have on the screen, I don't see any crime scene tape, What -- where was

TESTA - CROSS

calls to the appropriate other officers, correct?

A Yes, sir.

Q And one of those would have been to your sergeant?

A Yes, sir

Q And can you recall who that was?

A No, sir, I do not.

Q Did he respond to the scene also?

A I cannot remember, sir.

Q Would it be normal procedure that he would also respond?

A At times, depending on what was going on at that night, whether he was already on another call or was not able to get out at that point in time,

Q Do you recall who the first group of responding other individuals were?

A No, sir, I do not remember, sir,

Q But it would have been — you would have called your sergeant. Do you recall if you called homicide or if he called?

A I don't believe I called homicide. I made sure we called what -- at that time we had general assignment units who would have been on, on graveyard. And if I remember correctly, they would have responded along with 1.D, and then they would go ahead and make the notification to homicide, sir.

IV-137

2

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

VIV v. LOBATO 9/14/06

TESTA CROSS TESTA - CROSS wrapped around the body? BY MR. SCHIECK: 2 Q Let me show you three exhibits that have been A Yes, sir, Q And that's around the leg area? 3 marked as Defendant's Exhibit A, Defendant's Exhibit B and 4 Defendant's Exhibit E. A Yes, sir. Q Okay, But above where the pants are pulled down? 5 MR. SCHIECK: If I may approach, Your Honor. 5 6 6 A Oh, yes, sir. THE COURT: A, B and E? Q Did you notice anything else that was on the body 7 MR, SCHIECK: Yes, Your Honor, 7 while you were there other than the saran wrap or the plastic 8 THE COURT: Yes, you may. 9 wrap that appeared to be wrapped around the body? 9 BY MR. SCHIECK: 10 A Not that I can remember, sir, 10 Q Ask you to take a look at those and ask if you recognize those from the crime scene. 11 Q Nothing specific that stands out? 11 12 A Not that I can remember at this time, no, sir. 12 A Yes, sir. The first one would be a — Q And there was a lot of trash, various items from — 13 Q Don't describe them yet. 13 14 that were on the body? 14 A Okay, sir. Q We have to put them in. Do you recognize those A Yes, sir. 15 15 Q But you do recall specifically the cardboard? photographs? 16 16 17 A Yes, sir. 17 A Yes, sir, Q And the -- and the plastic wrap? 18 Q Do they fairly and accurately depict items that were 18 19 there at the area when you were there? 19 A Yes, sir, A Yes, sir. Q Had they completely uncovered the body by 7:00 20 20 21 o'clock when you left or was it still partially covered? MR. SCHIECK: I'd move for the admission of A, B 21 22 and E. 22 A Roughly, that I can remember, yes, sir, it was pretty much all uncovered, most of the items off the top of the body, 23 MS. DIGIACOMO: No objection. 23 24 sir, 24 THE COURT: Granted. IV-142 IV-144 TESTA - CROSS TESTA - CROSS Q So you don't know actually what time the body was (Defendant's Exhibits A, B, and E admitted) 1 BY MR. SCHIECK: transported? 2 2 3 Q I'm gonna show you or put up Defendant's A. And A No, I do not remember, sir, Q At any point in time did you have contact with the 4 can you tell us what's depicted there? Coroner's Office? A That would be a foot print, sir, 5 5 A I remember them coming out, sir, but I did not speak 6 Q Does it appear to be in blood? 7 A Yes, sir, with them that I can remember. No, sir. Q And just so we're clear on what we're looking at, I'm Q You didn't, you — you didn't call them out? 8 а gonna show you next what's been marked as State's 144 and A No, sir_i not that I remember, 9 Q That would have been someone else's responsibility? 10 have you take a look at that. And you've already identified 10 11 that as being bloody foot prints from the -- from the scene, 11 A Yes, sir. 12 12 Q Did you see anyone, while you were there watching, correct? step in blood and leave bloody foot prints? 13 A Yes, sir. 13 14 A Not that I know. No, sir. 14 Q Would it appear then that the main photograph or the main print on Exhibit A is just a closer photograph of this Q And there's no doubt in your mind when you first 15 15 print on 144? 16 16 arrived, the first arriving officer on the scene that gained 17 access, that the bloody foot print was there on concrete? 17 A Yes, sir. Q And that clearly -- in your opinion, does that show a 18 18 Q Okay. And those are depicted in photographs that shoe print? 19 19 20 were shown to you? 20 A Yes, sir. Q And, again, no one made that print while you were 21 21 A Yes, sir. there. It was there when you arrived? 22 22 MR. SCHIECK: The Court's indulgence, please. 23 THE COURT: Yes. 23 A Yes, sir, MR. SCHIECK: For the record, Your Honor, it (Off-record colloquy between Mr. Schieck and Mr. Kephart) 24 24 IV-143 IV-145

LOBATO 9/14/06

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

1

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22.

23

24

<u>. LOBATO</u> TESTA - CROSS appears that Defendant's B is a duplicate of State's 142 just admitted so there is some duplication there, BY MR, SCHIECK: Q And I'm gonna show you what's been admitted as Defendant's Exhibit E. You recognize what's depicted on E? A Yes, sir. Q And what is that? A That would be foot prints as well, sir, on the cardboard box. Q Okay. So there were also foot prints on the cardboard box? A Yes, sir Q Did you see those when you arrived? A Not when I first arrived, no, sir. Q Did you see them at some point? A Yes, sir, Q And when did you see them? A When the crime scene analysts would have been removing the cardboard and checking the box for further evidence and laying it out, Q Was that under some other debris then when you first arrived? A I do not remember for sure, sir, Q But it didn't come to your attention until the crime

IV-146

TESTA - CROSS

scene analysts were removing the cardboard?

A Correct, sir,

Q And I'm -- this is a silly question I know, but you didn't leave this foot print on the cardboard?

A No, sir,

Q And nobody did while you were there?

A No, sir,

Q So it must have been there when you arrived?

A Yes, sir,

Q Okay. You said that the lighting in that area you described as low light?

A Yes, sir.

What type of lighting was there in addition to your car?

A If there would have been any other light, I believe there was some from a light pole that was in the parking lot area, sir,

Q Just the light pole, no other lighting that you recall?

A Not that I can remember, sir,

Q Did you notice any skid marks on the ground when you were there?

A Not that I can remember, no, sir,

Q Do you recall seeing any crime scene analysts taking photographs or other methods to preserve tire tracks that

IV-147

TESTA - CROSS

were there at the scene?

A Not that I can remember, sir,

Q Do you recall whether there was any garbage inside of the dumpster itself, the one that you moved?

A I do not remember. No, sir,

Q It wasn't overflowing, was it?

A No, si

Q You would have remembered if it was overflowing garbage in there?

A Yes, sir.

Q Okay. But you have no recollection of how full or empty it may have been?

A No, I do not, sir.

THE COURT: We've hit the 5:00 o'clock hour,

MR. SCHIECK: I have no further questions, Your

Honor.

THE COURT: Okay.

MR, SCHIECK: Thank you very much, officer.

THE WITNESS: Yes, sir_

MS. DiGIACOMO: Your Honor, I just have a couple,

21 THE COURT: All right.

MS_ DiGIACOMO: Thank you,

23 ///

24 ///

IV-148

TESTA - REDIRECT REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MS, DiGIACOMO:

Q Now you said that you weren't tall enough to see over the dumpster?

A No,

Q Okay, And you said it was almost touching either side of the wall. Is it fair to say from where you were by the doors you couldn't see what was going on in the back behind the dumpster?

A Correct, ma'am,

Q When you first got there and opened the doors, did you notice any blood or foot prints?

A Not that I can remember at that time.

Q Okay. It wasn't until you actually moved the dimpster?

A Correct.

Q So if you hadn't have moved the dumpster and tried to make it through the side, would you have known if you were stepping on anything, blood foot prints or anything?

A By squeezing through the side?

Q Right,

A I probably wouldn't have noticed, no_

Q Now, how long have you been -- excuse me. Strike that. At the time back in July of 2001, how long had you been

then?

patrolling that area, West Flamingo and Arville?

A Approximately two years.

So you were familiar with the area pretty well back

TESTA - REDIRECT

A Yes.

Were you aware of any homeless camps or anyone dumpster-diving?

A That occurs generally throughout that area, yes.

Q Where -- are there any homeless camps close to the area of Wynn Road and West Flamingo?

A There is one in a wash area just off Flamingo and Valley View north, correction, I'm sorry, south of there. There's a wash area where there are homeless camps throughout that area,

Q How long do you — if you recall, how long did it take the crime scene analysts to actually get the trash out and actually uncover the body?

A Through most the shift, that I can remember, ma'am,

Q So hours?

A Yes.

MS. DiGIACOMO: The Court's indulgence, (Pause in the proceedings)

BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Okay. I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit Number

ESTA RECROSS

THE COURT: Recross,

MR. SCHIECK: Thank you, Your Honor.

RECROSS EXAMINATION

BY MR. SCHIECK:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Q You were asked some questions about this plastic, whatever it is, could have been garbage bags or something of that nature. Do you recall that they had to unwrap the plastic wrap from around the body?

A I do not remember, sir,

Q Do you recall testifying at a previous proceeding?

A Yes, sir.

Q Do you recall —

MR. SCHIECK: It's page 91, counsel, MS, DiGIACOMO: Thank you.

BY MR. SCHIECK:

Q Testifying that Exhibit 14 was an elongated shot of the body as they unwrapped it?

A Yes, sir.

Q Is that a fair description, that they had to unwrap that plastic from around the body?

A Possibly, sir. I really don't remember, sir.

Q Would you like to see your transcript on -- from that?MS, DiGIACOMO: Do you have a line, counsel?MR. SCHIECK: It's on line 2,

IV-150

TESTA - REDIRECT

12. Counsel pointed out some plastic wrap here,

A Yes,

Q Now, do you -- could you tell what that was? He was calling it saran wrap. But can you tell what it is?

A A type of plastic, That's all I really know, ma'am.

Q Is it — was it consistent with the plastic that the bags were made of that were around the dumpster area?

A Possibly. I couldn't say for sure,

Q The medic that went in there from the fire department, you mentioned the box that he had touched. Did he touch that with his bare hands?

A No, with gloves.

Q All right What did he do with the gloves that he had on after he was leaving the area?

A He would have disposed them into their biohazard. MS DiGIACOMO: The Court's indulgence.

BY MS. DiGIACOMO:

Q Okay. And you had said that you gave the medic personnel directions not -- of where not to step?

A Yes.

Q Would it have been easy if somebody wasn't paying attention to step in those areas they shouldn't have?

IV-151

A It is possible, yes

MS, DiGIACOMO: Nothing further,

IV-152 TESTA - RECROSS

MS. DiGIACOMO: Thank you.

BY MR. SCHIECK:

Q This would be Exhibit 14, If I showed you your testimony at a previous proceeding, would that refresh your recollection?

A Possibly, sir,

MR, SCHIECK: May I approach, Your Honor?

THE COURT: Yes.

(Pause in the proceedings)

THE WITNESS: Yes, sir,

BY MR, SCHIECK:

Q You did say they unwrapped it?

A Yes, sir.

Q And while you were there, did anyone come up and identify the body, to your recollection?

A Not that I remember. No, sir,

Q Did you have any contact with a lady by the name of Diane Parker?

A Not that I remember. No, sir.

Q Was there any civilians at all that you recall coming over to the area concerning the dead body? □

A Not that I know of, No, sir.

 $\label{eq:mr.schleck} \mbox{MR. SCHIECK: Thank you. No further questions.}$

MS, DIGIACOMO: Nothing further.

\|\V\v\OBATO\\\ 9/14/06

THE COURT: You may step down from the stand. 1 tomorrow? 2 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am. 2 THE COURT: 10:30. 3 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, well be taking MS. GREENBERGER: Okay. Thank you. our evening recess and resuming tomorrow morning at 10:30 4 THE COURT: You're welcome. a.m. At 10:30, please be in the hallway. The bailiff will meet We'll go off the record at this time you there to return you to your seats in the courtroom. 6 COURT ADJOURNED AT 17:10:04 UNTIL THE 7 During the recess, you're admonished not to talk or FOLLOWING DAY, SEPTEMBER 15, 2006 8 8 converse among yourselves, nor with anyone else, on any 9 subject connected with the trial, and you're not to read, watch or listen to any report of or commentary on the trial or any 10 person connected with the trial, by any medium of information, 11 including, without limitation, newspaper, television, radio and 12 13 Internet, and you're not to form or express any opinion on any subject connected with the trial until the case is finally 15 submitted to you. 16 16 You all have a good evening and we'll see you at 17 10:30 tomorrow, 17 18 18 The jury may exit, 19 19 (Jurors recessed at 17:07:26) 20 THE COURT: The record shall reflect that the jury 20 21 has exited and that counsel at sidebar agreed that they would 21 22 have no objection to any of the evidence that's been admitted in this trial being placed upon the ELMO for viewing by the jury 23 without having to do a motion for publication to the jury, and 24 IV-154 IV-156 the Court is accepting that stipulation. 2 I believe also the parties had stipulated not to use juror notebooks for the purposes of this trial. MS, DiGIACOMO: I believe we did, Your Honor 5 MS. GREENBERGER: What does that mean? THE COURT: The Nevada Supreme Court in the year 2004 issued an order that the attorneys prepared juror **AFFIRMATION** notebooks with all of the exhibits that are going to be admitted Pursuant to NRS 239B.030 into evidence for each member of the jury to have one of 10 those notebooks. It's become somewhat archaic in light of The undersigned does hereby affirm that the preceding Transcript filed in District Court, Case No C177394 11 having the ELMO which is a much faster presentation mode. does not contain the social security number of any person, 12 But the order is still out there. So since nobody showed up 13 with juror notebooks, I assumed that that was the case here, Lin Dunbar Is that right, Mr. Schieck? Transcriber 15 MR, SCHIECK: That's correct, Your Honor. 4/29/07 16 THE COURT: Very well, 17 Is there anything that we need to make of record 18 before I take us off? 19 MR. SCHIECK: No, Your Honor, 20 THE COURT: No. 21 MR, !KEPHART: Not by the State,

IV-157

THE COURT: We'll see you tomorrow morning.

MS. GREENBERGER: What time are we starting

MS DiGIACOMO: Thank you, Your Honor,

IV-155

22

23

24

CERTIFICATION

I (WE) CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING IS A **"ROUGH DRAFT"** TRANSCRIPT FROM THE ELECTRONIC SOUND RECORDING OF THE PROCEEDINGS IN THE ABOVE-EN_iii_LED MATTER.

NW TRANSCRIPTS, LLC
NEVADA DIVISION **1027** S. **RAINBOW BLVD., #148** □ LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89145-6232

ipts msn.com

1JYI MANAGER/OWNER

nwtr

<u>Lin Dunbar</u> TRANSCRIBER